



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru **The National Assembly for Wales**

Y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd **The Environment and Sustainability Committee**

Dydd Iau, 5 Chwefror 2015
Thursday, 5 February 2015

Cynnwys **Contents**

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions

Y Bil Llesiant Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol (Cymru): Cyfnod 2—Ystyried y Gwelliannau The Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill: Stage 2—Consideration of Amendments

Grŵp 1: Dyletswydd Llesiant (Gwelliannau 23, 120, 24, 161, 26C, 26A, 26B, 26D, 26E, 26F, 26, 28, 38A, 38B a 38)

Group 1: Well-being Duty (Amendments 23, 120, 24, 161, 26C, 26A, 26B, 26D, 26E, 26F, 26, 28, 38A, 38B, 38)

Grŵp 2: Egwyddor Datblygu Cynaliadwy (Gwelliannau 25, 160, 30B, 30A, 30C, 30D, 30E, 30, 35, 105, 43 a 68)

Group 2: Sustainable Development Principle (Amendments 25, 160, 30B, 30A, 30C, 30D, 30E, 30, 35, 105, 43 and 68)

Grŵp 3: Dyletswydd i roi sylw i Gonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn (Gwelliant 162)

Group 3: Duty to have regard to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (Amendment 162)

Grŵp 4: Nodau Llesiant (Gwelliannau 27, 27F, 27G, 27A, 27B, 27C, 27H, 27D, 27I, 27J, 27E, 29, 100, 101, 102, 103, 119, 163, 62A, 62, 63, 64, 66, 65, 67, 69, 70)

Group 4: Wellbeing Goals (Amendments 27, 27F, 27G, 27A, 27B, 27C, 27H, 27D, 27I, 27J, 27E, 29, 100, 101, 102, 103, 119, 163, 62A, 62, 63, 64, 66, 65, 67, 69, 70)

Grŵp 5: Amcanion Llesiant (Gwelliannau 31, 104, 32, 33, 34, 122, 123 ac 124)

Group 5: Well-being Objectives (Amendments 31, 104, 32, 33, 34, 122, 123 and 124)

Grŵp 6: Dangosyddion a Thargedau Cenedlaethol (Gwelliannau 106, 125, 164, 165, 107, 126, 127, 128, 166, 167, 129, 130, 131, 132, 133, 134, 135 a 108)

Group 6: National Indicators and Targets (Amendments 106, 125, 164, 165, 107, 126, 127, 128, 166, 167, 129, 130, 131, 132, 133, 134, 135 and 108)

Grŵp 7: Adroddiad Tueddiadau Tebygol y Dyfodol (Gwelliannau 168, 169, 73 a 170)

Group 7: Future Trends Report (Amendments 168, 169, 73 and 170)

Grŵp 8: Swyddogaeth Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru (Gwelliannau 99 a 98)

Group 8: Role of the Auditor General for Wales (Amendments 99 and 98)

Grŵp 9: Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol—Trefniadau Penodi a Chyfrifyddu

(Gwelliannau 109, 136, 171, 118, 53, 54, 55, 60, 19 a 20)

Group 9: Future Generations Commissioner—Appointment and Accounting Arrangements (Amendments 109, 136, 171, 118, 53, 54, 55, 60, 19 and 20)

Grŵp 10: Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol—Swyddogaethau (Gwelliannau 172, 137, 110, 173, 174, 175, 111, 36, 112, 113, 138, 85A, 85, 86, 87, 88, 89, 90A, 90, 140, 91, 176, 92, 93, 94, 95, 96, 97, 56, 57, 58, 59, 121 ac 84)

Group 10: Future Generations Commissioner—Functions (Amendments 172, 137, 110, 173, 174, 175, 111, 36, 112, 113, 138, 85A, 85, 86, 87, 88, 89, 90A, 90, 140, 91, 176, 92, 93, 94, 95, 96, 97, 56, 57, 58, 59, 121 and 84)

Grŵp 11: Panel Cynghori (Gwelliannau 114, 74, 141, 115, 143, 144 a 116)

Group 11: Advisory Panel (Amendments 114, 74, 141, 115, 143, 144 and 116)

Grŵp 12: Byrddau Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus—Cyfranogiad a Chraffu (Gwelliannau 177, 1, 178, 179, 145, 180, 37, 2, 3, 426, 27, 43, 54, 25 a 45)

Group 12: Public Services Boards—Participation and Scrutiny (Amendments 177, 1, 178, 179, 145, 180, 37, 2, 3, 426, 27, 43, 54, 25 and 45)

Grŵp 13: Byrddau Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus—Asesiadau Llesiant Lleol (Gwelliannau 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 181 a 182)

Group 13: Public Service Boards—Local Wellbeing Assessments (Amendments 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 181 and 182)

Grŵp 14: Byrddau Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus—Cynlluniau Llesiant Lleol (Gwelliannau 39, 40, 10, 41, 11, 12, 42, 13, 14, 15, 44, 45, 46, 47, 16, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 71 a 72)

Group 14: Public Services Boards—Local Wellbeing Plans (Amendments 39, 40, 10, 41, 11, 12, 42, 13, 14, 15, 44, 45, 46, 47, 16, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 71 and 72)

Grŵp 15: Byrddau Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus—amrywiol (Gwelliannau 75, 146, 147, 76, 77, 148, 149, 78, 150, 151, 152, 153, 154, 117, 155, 17, 156, 83, 21)

Group 15: Public Services Boards—miscellaneous (Amendments 75, 146, 147, 76, 77, 148, 149, 78, 150, 151, 152, 153, 154, 117, 155, 17, 156, 83, 21)

Grŵp 16: Ystyr “Corff Cyhoeddus”: Darpariaeth Bellach (Gwelliant 157)

Group 16: Meaning of “Public Body”: Further Provision (Amendment 157)

Grŵp 17: Pŵer i Wneud Darpariaeth Ganlyniadol (Gwelliannau 158, 183, 184, 185, 186 a 22)
 Group 17: Power to Make Consequential Provisions (Amendment 158, 183, 184, 185, 186 and 22)

Grŵp 18: Dehongli (Gwelliannau 79, 80, 81 ac 82)
 Group 18: Interpretation (Amendments 79, 80, 81 and 82)

Grŵp 19: Cychwyn (Gwelliannau 18 a 159)
 Group 19: Commencement (Amendments 18 and 159)

Grŵp 20: Teitl Hir (Gwelliannau 61, 61A a 61B)
 Group 20: Long Title (Amendments 61, 61A and 61B)

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.
 In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Mick Antoniw	Llafur Labour
Russell George	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Llyr Gruffydd	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Alun Ffred Jones	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Julie Morgan	Llafur Labour
William Powell	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Gwyn R. Price	Llafur (yn dirprwyo ar ran Jeff Cuthbert) Labour (substitute on behalf of Jeff Cuthbert)
Jenny Rathbone	Llafur Labour
Antoinette Sandbach	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Joyce Watson	Llafur Labour

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Louise Gibson	Cyfreithiwr, Llywodraeth Cymru Lawyer, Welsh Government
Clare Germain	Pennaeth Polisi Partneriaethau Llywodraeth Leol Head of Local Government Partnerships Policy
Amelia John	Pennaeth, Is-adran Dyfodol Tecach, Llywodraeth Cymru Head, Fairer Futures Division, Welsh Government
Owain Morgan	Cyfreithwr Lawyer

Carl Sargeant AM Y Gweinidog Cyfoeth Naturiol
Minister for Natural Resources

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Alun Davidson	Clerc Clerc
Gwyn Griffiths	Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol Legal Adviser
Catherine Hunt	Ail Glerc Second Clerk
Adam Vaughan	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:00.
The meeting began at 09:00.*

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions

[1] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A gaf i Alun Ffred Jones: May I welcome the groesawu'r Gweinidog, yr Aelodau a Minister, Members and the Minister's chynghorwyr y Gweinidog, ac mi fyddaf i'n advisers, and I'll also be welcoming the croesawu'r cyhoedd pan fyddant yn public when they arrive? The meeting is cyrraedd? Mae'r cyfarfod yn ddwyieithog ac bilingual and you can use the headphones. fe allwch chi ddefnyddio'r clustffonau.

[2] This is a bilingual session, as you know, and the translation is on channel 1, from Welsh to English, or there is enhancement on channel 2.

[3] Mae'r cyfarfod yn cael ei ddarlledu a The meeting is being broadcast and a bydd trawsgrifiad o'r trafodion yn cael ei transcript of the proceedings will be gyhoeddi. Fe atgoffaf bobl i ddiffodd eu published. I remind Members to switch off ffonau symudol, ac nid oes angen cyffwrdd their mobile phones and you don't need to â'r meicroffonau wrth gwrs. Os bydd yna touch the microphones of course. In the event of a fire alarm, then please do follow the larwm tân, yna dilynwch gyfarwyddiadau'r directions from the ushers. tywyswyr.

[4] Mae yna un ymddiheuriad gan Jeff There is one apology from Jeff Cuthbert and Cuthbert ac y mae Gwyn Price yn dirprwyo; Gwyn Price is substituting; welcome, Gwyn. croeso, Gwyn.

09:01

Y Bil Llesiant Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol (Cymru): Cyfnod 2—Ystyried y Gwelliannau The Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill: Stage 2—Consideration of Amendments

[5] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diben y cyfarfod Alun Ffred Jones: The purpose of today's heddiw yw cynnal trafodion Cyfnod 2 ar y meeting is to hold Stage 2 discussions on the Bil Llesiant Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol (Cymru) Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) ac y mae gennyh, fel Aelodau, y rhestr o Bill and you, as Members, have the welliannau wedi'u didoli a'r rhestr o'r marshalled list of amendments and the gwelliannau wedi'u grwpio ar gyfer trafod. groupings of amendments for discussion.

[6] Y rhestr o welliannau wedi'u didoli The marshalled list is the list of all of the ydy'r rhestr o'r holl welliannau a amendments tabled in the order in which the gyflwynwyd wedi'u didoli yn y drefn y mae'r sections to which they relate appear in the adrannau yn ymddangos yn y Bil. Felly, ar Bill. So, for the purpose of this meeting, the gyfer y cyfarfod hwn, y drefn ar gyfer trafod arrangement for discussing the amendments will be sections 1 to 3 to start, then sections 5 y gwelliannau fydd adrannau 1 i 3 i ddechrau, to 56, schedules 1 to 4, then section 4, and adrannau 5 i 56 wedyn, atodlenni 1 i 4, yna then the long title. adran 4 ac yna'r teitl hir.

[7] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Sorry, but it's not translating.

[8] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is it not translating?

[9] A yw'n dod rŵan?

Is it coming through now?

[10] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Yes.

[11] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gallwch weld o'r ddogfen grwpio gwelliannau fod y gwelliannau wedi'u grwpio i hwyluso'r drafodaeth, ond y mae'r drefn y cawn eu galw a'u cynnig er mwyn gwneud penderfyniad arnynt yn dilyn y rhestr o welliannau wedi'u didoli. Bydd angen i'r Aelodau ddilyn y ddau bapur, er byddaf yn gofyn i'r Aelodau, pan alwaf arnynt, a ydyn nhw'n siarad yn y ddadl neu'n cynnig eu gwelliannau er mwyn gwneud penderfyniad arnynt nhw. Bydd un ddadl ar bob grŵp o welliannau. Os ydych yn dymuno siarad, yna dangoswch hynny yn y ffordd arferol. Byddaf yn galw'r Gweinidog i siarad, wrth gwrs, ar bob grŵp.

Alun Ffred Jones: You will see from the groupings list that the amendments have been grouped to facilitate debate, but the order in which they are called and moved for a decision is dictated by the marshalled list. Members will need to follow the two papers, although I will advise Members, when I call them, whether they are being called to speak in the debate or to move their amendments for a decision. There will be one debate on each group of amendments. Members who wish to speak in a particular group should indicate this in the usual way. I will call the Minister to speak on each group.

[12] Er gwybodaeth, yn unol â'r confensiwn y cytunwyd arno gan y Pwyllgor Busnes, fel Cadeirydd, mi fyddai'n cynnig y gwelliannau yn enw'r Gweinidog ac, er hwylustod, rwy'n cymryd yn ganiataol y bydd y Gweinidog yn dymuno i mi gynnig ei welliannau. Mi wnaf hynny yn y man priodol yn y rhestr o welliannau. Weinidog, os nad ydych am i welliant penodol gael ei gynnig, yna nodwch hynny yn y cam perthnasol o'r trafodion.

For the record, in accordance with the convention agreed by the Business Committee, as Chair, I will move amendments in the name of the Minister and, for expediency, I will assume that the Minister wishes me to move all of his amendments, and I will do so at the appropriate place in the marshalled list. So, Minister, if you do not want a particular amendment to be moved, please indicate this at the relevant point in proceedings.

[13] Dyna ni, rwy'n credu. Rydym yn barod felly i ddechrau ar y gwelliannau.

That's it, I think. We're ready to start with the amendments.

Grŵp 1: Dyletswydd Llesiant (Gwelliannau 23, 120, 24, 161, 26C, 26A, 26B, 26D, 26E, 26F, 26, 28, 38A, 38B a 38)

Group 1: Well-being Duty (Amendments 23, 120, 24, 161, 26C, 26A, 26B, 26D, 26E, 26F, 26, 28, 38A, 38B, 38)

[14] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Trown felly at y grŵp cyntaf: dyletswydd llesiant. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 23 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Felly, rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 23 a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad am ei welliant ac am y gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp.

Alun Ffred Jones: We'll turn therefore to the first group in relation to the wellbeing duty. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 23 in the name of the Minister. Therefore, I move amendment 23 and I call on the Minister to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in this group.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 23 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 23 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[15] **The Minister for Natural Resources (Carl Sargeant):** Thank you, Chair. Good morning, committee. It looks like it's going to be a marathon event, but I'm sure it'll be worth while in the end. Can I thank the Chair for his comments and supporting the group amendments in my name? I've considered carefully the need to provide clarity in the Bill, as recommended by the committee in their reporting stage, and have proposed a substantive amendment 26 to provide a clearer wellbeing duty for bringing together into one place the key parts of the wellbeing duty.

[16] Amendments 23, 24, 34 and 35 provide the necessary deletions of the existing provisions within the Bill to secure this. I'd ask the Members to support the Government's amendments and I will also, in this group, be supporting non-Government amendment 26D in the name of Llyr Huws Gruffydd. We believe this adds value and strengthens the section in the Bill. I'd ask the committee to consider those amendments.

[17] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. A gaf i alw ar Antoinette Sandbach? May I call on Antoinette Sandbach to speak?

[18] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I move amendment 120 in this group. This amendment inserts 'current' as well as 'future generations' into the Bill. I think it puts on the face of the Bill the fact that the needs of both current and future generations need to be taken into account, and whilst it's clear that it's present in the explanatory memorandum and other documents, I think this makes it express on the face of the Bill.

[19] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I Rwy'n galw ar Llyr Huws Gruffydd i siarad. I call on Llyr Huws Gruffydd to speak.

[20] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch. Rwy'n cynnig gwelliannau 161, 26C, 26D, 26E, 26F, 38A a 38B. A gaf i ddweud, mae gwelliant 161 yn ymwneud â diffiniad a dehongliad, os leiciwch chi, o 'lesiant'? Mi gawsom ni dystiolaeth fel pwyllgor fod 'llesiant' yn cael ei ddefnyddio mewn termau a chyd-destunau gwahanol, braidd yn ddryslyd, efallai, yn y Bil. Nawr, weithiau, mae'n cyfeirio at lesiant Cymru fel gwlad, weithiau fel pobl Cymru, weithiau yng nghyd-destun unigolion, ac weithiau gymunedau ac yn y blaen. Felly, yr hyn yr wyf am sicrhau yn y gwelliant yma yw bod yna ddiffiniad sy'n rhoi eglurder mai llesiant Cymru a'i phobl yn gyffredinol sydd gyda ni mewn golwg bob tro, oni bai bod, wrth gwrs, y cyd-destun yn gofyn am ddehongliad mwy penodol.

Llyr Gruffydd: Thank you. I move amendments 161, 26C, 26D, 26E, 26F, 38A and 38B. May I say that amendment 161 relates to the definition of 'wellbeing'? We as a committee received evidence that 'wellbeing' was being used in different contexts that were, perhaps, rather confusing, in the Bill. Now, on occasion, it refers to the wellbeing of Wales as a nation, sometimes the people of Wales, sometimes in the context of individuals, and sometimes communities and so on and so forth. So, what I want to ensure in this amendment is that there is a definition that provides clarity that it's the wellbeing of Wales and its people as a whole that we have in mind, unless, of course, the context requires a more limited or specific interpretation.

[21] Nawr, mae gwelliant 161 yn welliant i'r Bil gwreiddiol, fel y'i gosodwyd. Mae gwelliant 26F yn welliant sy'n cyflawni'r un pwrpas o safbwynt y gwelliannau sydd wedi eu gosod gan y Llywodraeth.

Now, amendment 161 is an amendment to the Bill as tabled. Amendment 26F is an amendment that achieves the same purpose in terms of the amendments tabled by the Government.

[22] On amendment 26C, to be inserted into the amended wellbeing duty on public bodies, and elsewhere, actually—it permeates other parts of the Bill as well—I'm asking for culture to be included as one of the internationally recognised pillars of sustainable development. It

is, of course, a fourth pillar, in many respects, of sustainable development. ‘One Wales: One Planet’ emphasises the importance of the Welsh language and culture as part of sustainable development and wellbeing in Wales, and I believe that this amendment would ensure consistency with that policy. There is, as I suggested, international recognition of culture as the fourth pillar of sustainable development, including the principles of the UNESCO 2005 convention on the protection and promotion of cultural expressions, and I’ll quote article 2, paragraph 6, if I may, on the principle of sustainable development. It tells us that,

[23] ‘Cultural diversity is a rich asset for individuals and societies. The protection, promotion and maintenance of cultural diversity are an essential requirement for sustainable development for the benefit of present and future generations.’

[24] Article 13, on integration of culture in sustainable development, tells us that,

[25] ‘Parties shall endeavour to integrate culture in their development policies at all levels for the creation of conditions conducive to sustainable development and, within this framework, foster aspects relating to the protection and promotion of the diversity of cultural expressions.’

[26] Amendments 38A and 38B also, hopefully, will mean that we will include culture as well. Amendment 26D is to insert two words, and I recognise the Minister’s agreement to support this amendment. It would ensure that public bodies must contribute to the achievement of each of the wellbeing goals. Now, the purpose of that, of course, is to ensure that one goal can’t be possibly traded against another.

[27] Amendment 26E: the Bill says that anything a public body does under this section must be done in accordance with the sustainable development principle. I’d like to add,

[28] ‘whether or not that relates to its wellbeing objectives’,

[29] because that would limit the possibility of a public body acting outside the provisions of the Bill, by virtue of its actions not being maybe specifically included in its wellbeing objectives.

[30] I believe I can make some comments on some of the other amendments. On amendment 120, tabled by Antoinette Sandbach, I won’t be supporting that particular amendment to add reference to current generations. There’s a series of those amendments that obviously will be dealt with as we move along. I don’t believe it’s necessary because the Bill is about current wellbeing and also the sustainable development principle, I believe, is clear that both current and future generations are part of the consideration, and adding it throughout the Bill, I think, would move the meaning of sustainable development away from the internationally recognised concept from the Brundtland report.

[31] I would also comment on amendment 26, which is a Government amendment. I recognise that the Government has made, certainly, a start on strengthening the Bill in line with committee recommendations, but I’m minded to abstain on most Government amendments. I’ll also probably be voting against some because I honestly believe that there’s a lot more work that needs to be done in Stage 3.

[32] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. William Powell.

[33] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I move amendments 26A and 26B. These are modest but, I’d argue, important amendments. They involve the insertion of ‘all’ at line 3 after ‘of’, and I would argue that, in doing so, it helps the goals to be balanced against each other. There is no sense of hierarchy here, but by the insertion of ‘all’, the goals have to be

given equal consideration. I think that's picking up maybe the theme that Llyr mentioned in regard to his amendment 26D, which I heard the Minister is minded to support. I think that both 26A and 26B do add value, and I would ask for support on those. With regard to amendment 120, I shall be supporting that because I think it does serve a useful purpose to include explicit reference to 'current' at this point and in subsequent sections of the Bill. I also recognise, as Llyr Gruffydd has done, that the Government has moved in some respects in a positive direction. On some of the amendments at this stage I'm likely to be abstaining, but there are going to be certain amendments I've identified that I'm not going to be in a position to support and will be voting against. Thank you.

[34] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Diolch yn fawr. Mae Julie Morgan wedi dweud bod hi'n awyddus i siarad. Julie. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay. Thank you. Julie Morgan has indicated that she wishes to speak. Julie.

[35] **Julie Morgan:** Yes, just to say that I will be voting in support of the Government amendments, and I note that the Minister has been very influenced by what the committee has said and has made considerable changes, so I do think we've made a lot of progress and, you know, moved amendments 23, 24 and 25, which removed the sections from the Bill in the way that the committee did ask him to do. So, I want to say that I'll be supporting the Government amendments, and I'm pleased that the Minister is accepting the amendment from Llyr Huws Gruffydd, amendment 26D.

[36] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Dyna ni. Diolch yn fawr, Julie. A'r Gweinidog i ymateb. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay. Thank you very much, Julie. And the Minister to reply.

[37] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I've listened very carefully to the comments of Members. Of course, while I've taken very clear guidance from the committee report in making significant amendments to the Bill I also understand that we are only at Stage 2 and there is a further stage where we can make possible further amendments that will, I hope, aid all of the committee to be supportive of the Government Bill. Bill Powell's amendments I don't think are necessary on the basis that I will be supporting Llyr's amendment, which does in principle the same but with different wording. I don't believe Antoinette Sandbach's amendment is appropriate on the basis of Llyr's explanation in terms of that the current principle is already applied to this Bill and is expected to be considered. Therefore, it is unnecessary in drafting terms. I'm grateful for Llyr's positive interaction in terms of the Bill proposals moving forward, but, at this stage, the Member I would hope would also recognise our commitment to the cultural activity as laid down in goal 6, which is

[38] 'A Wales of vibrant culture and thriving Welsh language',

[39] which will enshrine the cultural activity of decision making within this sustainable development Bill. Therefore, we won't be, at this point, able to support this principle at this stage.

09:15

[40] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Weinidog, a hoffech chi symud i bleidlais ar welliant 23? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Minister, do you wish to proceed to a vote on amendment 23?

[41] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, please.

[42] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Os derbynir gwelliant 23, bydd gwelliant 120 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 23? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right. If amendment 23 is agreed, amendment 120 will fall. The question is that amendment 23 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We

[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Os felly, ceir pleidlais drwy ddangos dwylo. Y cwestiwn, felly, yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 23? Y rheiny o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Iawn. Ac yn erbyn. A'r rheiny sy'n ymatal i godi eu dwylo. Diolch yn fawr. Canlyniad y bleidlais ydy bod y gwelliant wedi ei dderbyn. Diolch yn fawr.

will therefore move to a vote by a show of hands. So, the question is, therefore, that amendment 23 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. And those abstaining. Thank you very much. The result of the vote is that the amendment has been agreed. Thank you very much.

*Gwelliant 23: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 23: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 23.
Amendment 23 agreed.*

[43] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 120—mae wedi methu, sori, wrth gwrs ei fod o.

Alun Ffred Jones: Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 120—sorry, it's fallen, of course it has.

*Methodd gwelliant 120 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 120 fell (Antoinette Sandbach).*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 24 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 24 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[44] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, cynigiau welliant 24 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: Therefore, I move amendment 24 in the name of the Minister.

[45] A ddylid derbyn gwelliant 24? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, ceir pleidlais drwy ddangos dwylo. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 24. Y rheiny o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai sy'n ymatal i godi eu dwylo. Mae gwelliant 24 felly wedi ei dderbyn.

The question is that amendment 24 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] I will therefore take a vote by show of hands. The question is that amendment 24 be agreed. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against please raise your hands. Those abstaining please raise your hands. Amendment 24 therefore is agreed.

*Gwelliant 24: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 24: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 24.
Amendment 24 agreed.*

Grŵp 2: Egwyddor Datblygu Cynaliadwy (Gwelliannau 25, 160, 30B, 30A, 30C, 30D, 30E, 30, 35, 105, 43 a 68)
Group 2: Sustainable Development Principle (Amendments 25, 160, 30B, 30A, 30C, 30D, 30E, 30, 35, 105, 43 and 68)

[46] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit, rydym yn symud rŵan i grŵp 2, yr egwyddor datblygu cynaliadwy. Prif welliant y grŵp yw gwelliant 25 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: Right, we move to group 2, which relates to the sustainable development principle. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 25 in the name of the Minister.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 25 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 25 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[47] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 25.

Alun Ffred Jones: Therefore, I move amendment 25.

[48] Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad am y gwelliant ac am y gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp hwn—Weinidog.

I call on the Minister to speak to this amendment and the other amendments in the group—Minister.

[49] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you. I'm seeking support for amendments in this group in my name: 25, 30, 35, 43 and 68. I've reviewed section 3, as suggested again by committee, and have tabled appropriate amendments bringing together the definition of sustainable development principle into one clear provision. This provides a clear, stronger statement of direction for public bodies. Amendment 30 brings together the description of the principle from section 3 and the five sustainable governance approaches in section 8(2) into a consolidated duty.

[50] Chair, these amendments make it absolutely clear what the sustainable development principle means in practice. It's a process through which we achieve wellbeing and is not an end in itself. Sustainable development as a process is consistent with how it's defined in 'One Wales: One Planet', as Llyr often mentions in his contributions. It was always our intention that sustainable development should be core to what public bodies do, but I recognise that this may have not been as clear as it could have been in the first drafting of the Bill. These amendments, I believe, put this beyond doubt. I would ask you to move in my name.

[51] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar Llyr Gruffydd i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you very much. I call on Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[52] **Llyr Gruffydd:** I'd like to move amendments 160, 30B, 30C, 30D and 30E in this group.

[53] Amendment 160 is to substitute the definition of sustainable development in the Bill as laid and substitute it with, of course, the definition of sustainable development from 'One Wales: One Planet'. I believe that a definition of sustainable development needs to be clearly on the face of the Bill in order to provide clarity, longevity, certainty and to reduce litigation concerns as well. Without a definition on the Bill, the policy could, I think, be subject to political changes resulting in uncertainty in the direction of travel for all sectors involved. It reduces the risk of multiple, conflicting and confusing definitions from different legislation and policy. I think the 'One Wales: One Planet' definition has been agreed by the Assembly and certainly has strong currency in Wales. So, my amendment 160 seeks to insert that

definition into the Bill as laid. Amendment 30B seeks to effectively insert that definition into Government amendment 30.

[54] My amendment 30C seeks to insert the words

[55] ‘and steps taken to meet them’.

[56] Now, this is about preparing wellbeing objectives, which shouldn’t in itself be sufficient for a body to meet its duties under the Bill. It should be about the action they take towards meeting them as well, and I think that is reflected somewhat in other amendments from the Government and others, and I think that the addition of this particular amendment would contribute positively to strengthening that as well.

[57] Amendment 30D: this is about the relationship between the objectives and the goals, and I think it would strengthen the integration principle by ensuring that impacts on the goals are dealt with in the same way as impacts on objectives. The amendment ensures that the wording of both clauses 2(b)(i) and 2(b)(ii) better reflect each other and, taken with amendments 26A and 26B, I think it generally strengthens integration in the Bill.

[58] Finally, amendment 30E adds to what a public body must take into account to include references, of course, to sound science and the precautionary principle—two key principles of sustainable development, which are included in ‘One Wales: One Planet’ but are currently omitted, I think, from this Bill. So, it would ensure that evidence in future trends reports is taken into account when making decisions, and of course that would give us stronger and more robust future trends reports.

[59] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Galwaf ar **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay. I call William William Powell i siarad. Powell to speak.

[60] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I propose amendment 30A, which, in my view, will add significantly to what this Bill will deliver. It’s been a consistent theme of our work in committee that we need to have absolute clarity on the importance of respecting and living within environmental limits and also in terms of the importance of facilitating the use of the Welsh language, and I think that this would add significant strength to this particular section of the Bill.

[61] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Jenny Rathbone.

[62] **Jenny Rathbone:** Just to respond to Llyr Huws Gruffydd on amendment 160, whilst I’m a great supporter of the aspirations in ‘One Wales: One Planet’ it is not written in language that would stick, whereas I think—. I think it would be excellent if we could have some reference to it in the explanatory memorandum, but I think that the new section 30 is much clearer in laying down in practical terms what public bodies have to do in order to apply the principles of sustainable development in terms of having to, you know, take integrated approaches, balancing short-term needs against long-term needs, acting in collaboration, and involving other people who may have an interest in a particular issue. So, I think that the new section 30 does, you know—it enforces the need for public bodies in a way that I think, whilst ‘One Wales: One Planet’ is a great aspiration, it’s not something you could get to stick when it came to the law.

[63] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette Sandbach.

[64] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Well, I’m not sure that I agree with that, although we will in fact be abstaining on amendment 160. If it wasn’t legally admissible it wouldn’t have been allowed to be tabled, so it clearly does provide a definition that can be voted on and that can

be acted on in the Bill. But we will be supporting amendments 30C and 30D for the reasons that Llyr Huws Gruffydd has outlined.

[65] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Felly, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay. Therefore, I call galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ymateb i'r ddadl. the Minister to reply to the debate.

[66] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. Again, I thank colleagues for their comments. Can I start with our understanding that the Bill provides a clear and more defined definition of the outcome of sustainable development in the wellbeing goals, and how to do that in a sustainable way is the sustainable development principle? I am considering how to provide a stronger legislative link between all of the Bills, including the Planning (Wales) Bill and the Environment (Wales) Bill, which will be coming forward in the spring, and how we can link all our activity around that back to the future generations Bill, which, in essence, is the sustainable development principle as a whole Bill and not just purely a definition. This is the sustainable development process. This will ensure, I believe, that planning system, land management, et cetera, will all be achieved in applying the sustainable principles and goals, as set out in this Bill, should it be passed and supported. We only have to look at the United Nations, and focusing their attention in 2015 is a set of goals and supporting framework very similar to the work that we're doing, and not a definition, as I've pointed out previously.

[67] I think Jenny Rathbone's point in terms of 'One Wales: One Planet' is appropriate. We don't believe it is as strong as it could be drafted in terms of legal terms, and I also accept that it is admissible, because it is a document. However, in definition, it isn't as strong as it could be and that's why we believe—. I will give that further consideration in terms of how we could link the 'One Wales: One Planet' document into the explanatory memorandum, as we move forward at the next stage, and I'd be happy to report back to committee on that.

[68] Can I turn to William Powell's amendment 30A? We believe that would provide unnecessary duplication, as all of the aspects listed are provided for in the wellbeing goals, as amended further into the Bill. Can I pick up—my final point—on Llyr's 30E, which is a link to the future trends report and the precautionary principle, I think, as drafted, by the Member? I support the principle, indeed, of part of Llyr's amendment in 30E—the need for a clearer link between the future trends report and the application of the sustainable development principle. I will, at a further stage, Chair, consider bringing forward an amendment at that stage, which would, in principle, be supporting what Llyr is looking to do at that stage. However, the reason I can't support this amendment at this stage is because of the additional element to that amendment, which provides for the seventh approach in relation to the precautionary principle, which I believe would, potentially, be a loophole in the Bill and, therefore, we will not be supporting that element. But, indeed, my commitment to bring back a further amendment in support of the principle of the future trends report is something I will do at a later stage.

[69] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Weinidog, hoffech chi symud i bleidlais ar welliant 25? Minister, do you wish to move to a vote on amendment 25?

[70] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, please.

[71] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 25? A oes yna wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Mae gwrthwynebiad, felly rydym yn symud i bleidlais. Felly, y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 25? Y rheini o blaid. Diolch yn fawr. A'r rhai sydd yn erbyn, a'r rhai sydd **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 25 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] There is objection, therefore, we will move to a vote by show of hands. So, the question is that amendment 25 be agreed. Those in favour. Thank you. Those against, and those abstaining.

yn ymatal. Felly, mae gwelliant 25 wedi ei dderbyn. Therefore, amendment 25 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 25: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 25: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 25.
Amendment 25 agreed.*

[72] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 160?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 160?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 160 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 160 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[73] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes.

[74] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 160? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 160? Y rheini o blaid i godi'u dwylo, a'r rhai yn erbyn, a'r rhai sy'n ymatal. Diolch. Nid yw gwelliant 160 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 160 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we will move to a vote by show of hands. The question is that amendment 160 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands, and those against, and those abstaining. Thank you. Therefore, amendment 160 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 160: O blaid 3, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 160: For 3, Abstain 2, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 160.
Amendment 160 not agreed.*

[75] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 161?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 161?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 161 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 161 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[76] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes.

[77] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 161? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 161. A wnewch chi, y rhai o blaid, godi eich dwylo? A'r rhai sydd yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, hynny yw, yn erbyn y gwelliant, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.20(ii). Felly, ni dderbynnir gwelliant 161.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 161 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote by show of hands on amendment 161. Those in favour, please raise your hands. And those against. There is a tied vote, therefore, I use my casting vote in the negative, that is, against the amendment, in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii). So, amendment 161 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 161: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 161: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 161.
Amendment 161 not agreed.*

09:30

Grŵp 3: Dyletswydd i roi sylw i Gonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn (Gwelliant 162)

Group 3: Duty to have regard to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (Amendment 162)

[78] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn ymlaen at grŵp 3. Mae hwn yn ymwneud â'r ddyletswydd i roi sylw i Gonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn. Yr unig welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 162.

Alun Ffred Jones: We move on to group 3. This relates to the duty to have regard to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. The only amendment in this group is amendment 162.

[79] **Llyr Gruffydd:** A gaf fi ddweud nad wyf yn bwriadu cynnig y gwelliant yma?

Llyr Gruffydd: May I say that I do not intend to move this amendment?

[80] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I'm not getting translation, sorry.

[81] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Arhoswn am

Alun Ffred Jones: We will wait for a

eiliad. A yw'r cyfieithu'n gweithio rwan?

second. Is the interpretation working now?

[82] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Rwyf i jest am ddweud nad wyf yn bwriadu cynnig y gwelliant yma; byddaf i'n ei dynnu yn ôl. Rwy'n deall bod trafodaethau yn digwydd gyda mudiadau plant ac ieuenctid, ac felly mae'n bosibl y bydd y mater yn gallu cael ei ddelio ag ef yng Nghyfnod 3. Ond, mae gen i welliannau eraill i berwyl tebyg yn nes ymlaen ac mi fyddaf i'n siarad i'r rheini. Felly, nid oes gennyf fwriad i symud gwelliant 162.

Llyr Gruffydd: I wanted to say that I do not intend to move this amendment; I will be withdrawing it. I understand that there are discussions going on with children and young people's organisations, and so perhaps this issue can be dealt with at Stage 3. But, I have other amendments that are in a similar vein later on and I will be speaking to those. Therefore, I have no intention of moving amendment 162.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 162 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 162 (Llyr Gruffydd) not moved.*

[83] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Nid yw wedi cael ei symud, felly symudwn ymlaen at welliant 26. Cyn gwaredu gwelliant 26, byddwn yn ymdrin â'r gwelliannau i'r gwelliant hwnnw. Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 26C?

Alun Ffred Jones: It hasn't been moved, so we therefore move on to amendment 26. Before disposing of amendment 26, we will deal with the amendments to that amendment. Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 26C?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 26C (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 26C (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[84] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes.

[85] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn felly yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 26C? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Y rheini o blaid gwelliant 26C i ddangos eu dwylo; pump. Yn erbyn; pump. Felly, gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, hynny yw, yn erbyn y gwelliant, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir 26C.

Alun Ffred Jones: So, the question is that amendment 26C be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll move to a vote by show of hands. Those in favour of amendment 26C please raise your hands; five. Against; five. Therefore, as there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, that is, against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 26C is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 26C: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 26C: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 26C.
Amendment 26C not agreed.*

[86] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 26A?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 26A?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 26A (William Powell).
Amendment 26A (William Powell) moved.*

[87] **William Powell:** Yes.

[88] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 26A? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn at bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 26A. Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo; tri. Yn erbyn; pump. Ymatal; dau.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 26A be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we will move to a vote. The question is that amendment 26A be agreed to. Those in favour to raise their hands; three. Against; five. Abstaining; two.

*Gwelliant 26A: O blaid 3, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 26A: For 3, Abstain 2, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 26A.
Amendment 26A not agreed.*

[89] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 26B?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 26B?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 26B (William Powell).
Amendment 26B (William Powell) moved.*

[90] **William Powell:** Yes, please, Chair.

[91] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 26B? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn at bleidlais. Y rhai sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo; tri. Yn erbyn, ac yn ymatal. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 26B.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 26B be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll move to a vote. Those in favour to raise their hands. Against, and abstaining. Therefore, amendment 26B is not agreed.

Gwelliant 26B: O blaid 3, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 26B: For 3, Abstain 2, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 26B.
Amendment 26B not agreed.*

[92] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 26D?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 26D?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 26D (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 26D (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[93] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes.

[94] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn 26D. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Iawn, felly symudwn at bleidlais. Y rheini o blaid 26D i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda. Yn erbyn, ac yn ymatal. Felly, derbyniwyd gwelliant 26D.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 26D be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We will therefore move to a vote. Those in favour of 26D raise your hands, please. Those against, and those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 26D is agreed.

*Gwelliant 26D: O blaid 8, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 26D: For 8, Abstain 2, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Gruffydd, Llyr
Morgan, Julie
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 26D.
Amendment 26D agreed.*

[95] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 26E?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 26E?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 26E (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 26E (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[96] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes.

[97] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 26E? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn at bleidlais ar 26E. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 26E? Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn, ac yn ymatal. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 26E.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 26E be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we move to a vote on 26E. The question is that amendment 26E be agreed to. Those in favour to raise their hands. Those against, and those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 26E is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 26E: O blaid 3, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 26E: For 3, Abstain 2, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 26E.
Amendment 26E not agreed.*

[98] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 26F?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 26F?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 26F (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 26F (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[99] **Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes.

[100] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn 26F? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn at bleidlais ar 26F. Y rhai sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Yn ymatal. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 26F.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 26F be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We will move to a vote on 26F. Those in favour to raise their hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 26F is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 26F: O blaid 3, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 26F: For 3, Abstain 2, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 26F.
Amendment 26F not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 26 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 26 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[101] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 26 in
gwelliant 26 yn enw'r Gweinidog. the name of the Minister.

[102] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cymryd **Alun Ffred Jones:** I take it that you wish to
eich bod chi am symud at bleidlais. move to a vote.

[103] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes.

[104] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, y cwestiwn **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, the question is that
yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 26 fel y'i amendment 26, as amended, be agreed. Does
diwygiwyd? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad. any Member object? [*Objection.*] Yes. Right,
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Reit, rydym yn symud i we will move to a vote therefore on
bleidlais felly ar welliant 26 wedi'i ddiwygio. amendment 26 as amended. Those in favour,
Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai sydd raise your hands. Those against, raise your
yn erbyn i godi eu dwylo. Mae honno'n hands. That is a tied vote. So, I use my
gyfartal. Felly, gan fod y bleidlais yn casting vote in the negative, that is, against
gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw the amendment, in accordance with Standing
yn negyddol, hynny yw, yn erbyn y Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 26 as
gwelliant, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. amended is not agreed.
Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 26 fel y'i
diwygiwyd.

*Gwelliant 26 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 26 as amended: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â
Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing
Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 26 fel y'i diwygiwyd.
Amendment 26 as amended not agreed.*

Grŵp 4: Nodau Llesiant (Gwelliannau 27, 27F, 27G, 27A, 27B, 27C, 27H, 27D, 27I, 27J, 27E, 29, 100, 101, 102, 103, 119, 163, 62A, 62, 63, 64, 66, 65, 67, 69, 70)

Group 4: Wellbeing Goals (Amendments 27, 27F, 27G, 27A, 27B, 27C, 27H, 27D, 27I, 27J, 27E, 29, 100, 101, 102, 103, 119, 163, 62A, 62, 63, 64, 66, 65, 67, 69, 70)

[105] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Grŵp 4 yw nodau llesiant, ac mae rhes o welliannau yma. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 27 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad am ei welliant ac am y gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp hwn.

Alun Ffred Jones: Group 4 is the wellbeing goals, and there is a list of amendments here. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 27 in the name of the Minister. I call on the Minister to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in this group.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 27 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 27 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[106] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I'd like to ask you to formally move the amendments in my name in this group. My amendments 27 and 29 respond to the views of the committee that the wording of the wellbeing goals needed to be strengthened in respect of a number of key issues. Taken as a package, these amendments make a number of changes. There are now direct references to climate change in the first two goals. The second goal has been amended to include a more explicit reference to the issues on environmental limits, and the first goal has been rewritten to include an explicit reference to decent work. A new goal relating to global international impacts has been added. Specified public bodies will now be required to take account of the contribution they are making to global wellbeing when setting their wellbeing objectives and taking action to meet them.

[107] In addition, the committee recommended that there should be an enhanced procedure for making changes to the wellbeing goals in the future, and amendment 27 provides for this. Amendments 29, 62 and 70 are consequential to amendment 27 and they remove section 6 and the original goals as drafted. I would ask you to formally support, and I move.

[108] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar Llyr Gruffydd i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you very much. I call on Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[109] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. I am speaking to amendments 27F, 27G, 27H, 27I, 27J 163 and 62A. On 27F, which relates to the first goal, I think I've been pretty consistent in making comments in this committee around the use of the description—. The descriptor is a bit problematic in its use of the word 'proportionate', because it's not mentioned in relation to anything. So, the question is: proportionate to what? So, it doesn't, in any way, I believe, meet the requirement to live within environmental limits. It's not as precise as the intention of one-planet nation and the concept of using only a fair share of the earth's resources. 'Proportionate share' is used because it better reflects, in my view, the distributional aspects in 'One Wales: One Planet' of fair share. So, that's 27F. 27G amends the second goal. Now, whilst welcoming the wording regarding the need for sustainable resource use, I feel that it better belongs in goal 1, where it could qualify the economy's proportionate use of resources. Goal 2 should remain focused on providing a healthy, diverse natural environment, and this amendment recognises the importance as well of recovering biodiversity from its current degraded state and, therefore, substantially strengthens, in my view, the resilience goal.

[110] Amendment 27H amends the sixth goal, and it's to add, really, a society that

[111] 'at every level, from the community to the Welsh level'

[112] promotes and protects culture, heritage, language, et cetera. It clarifies, I think, that public bodies should consider the state of the Welsh language at a community level, not only at the level of the relevant body—for example, the impact of planning strategies on a community level, et cetera. So, it reflects the emphasis as well on the community level in the Government’s own Welsh language strategy. So, I feel that that’s an important amendment that needs to be included in the Bill.

[113] Amendments 27I and 27J go hand in hand. They relate to the new goal—goal 7. I fully support the addition of a global goal, and I welcome that. However, all other goal descriptors are aspirational and positive, and this amendment would make goal 7 consistent with those. The other goals use words like ‘enables’, ‘promotes’, ‘enhances’; this one says ‘takes account of’, which I don’t feel is strong enough. Taking account of something alone is insufficient, I think, to express the intentions we are trying to achieve here. So, these amendments would strengthen this, while of course remaining, I believe, within competence.

[114] Amendment 163—I will not be moving that one because other amendments, I think, offer a stronger process with greater Assembly involvement, and I will be supporting those. Amendment 62A refers back to the adding of ‘cultural’ to the economic, environmental and social pillars, and would be consistent with my previous amendments and previous remarks earlier on.

[115] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I Galwaf ar William Powell i siarad. call on William Powell to speak.

[116] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. **William Powell:** Thank you, Chair.

[117] I speak to amendments 27A, 27B, 27C, 27D, 27E, and also—to turn the page—to amendments 100, 102 and 103. In the case of 27A, we feel that our amendment is useful in that, if the quality and diversity of the Welsh landscape is to be assured for future generations, then the notion of scale must be reflected in that definition. That’s the purpose of 27A. Moving to 27B, we are again of the view that the amendment reflects that scale, quality and diversity, along with the need for change to take place within acceptable limits, and that’s absolutely critical. It must all be recognised as an integral part of the correct interpretation of the term ‘resilience’, and that’s what we’re bringing in terms of that amendment. In terms of 27C, we feel again that the Welsh public feel and have a strong connection with their specific localities, and that reflects the individuality, and should convey the distinctive identity, of a community’s sense of place, and that is what we are seeking to achieve there. Amendment 27D, again, is the issue of valuing local identity and traditions, both of which we feel are important aspects of wellbeing and should be appropriately reflected in the goals. With 27E, again, our rationale is this: if the wellbeing goals are credible enough to be on the face of the Bill—and, indeed, that is our view—then they shouldn’t be able to be changed without a comprehensive and careful consideration, i.e. by primary legislation. So, that is our respect in terms of the amendments under 27.

[118] Amendment 100—as I said in earlier remarks, we feel that the effect of this amendment would be that the goals could be more effectively balanced against each other, and that there is no sense of hierarchy there, but they need to be considered in the round. So, we’re looking for support on those amendments, which we feel would bring greater strength to this section of the Bill.

[119] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I Galwaf ar Russell George i siarad. call on Russell George to speak.

[120] **Russell George:** Chair, I move amendment 119. This amendment allows for the removal of the ability for Welsh Ministers to review or revise the wellbeing goals. A number

of stakeholders had raised concerns in this regard with us. The committee has agreed that the wellbeing goals should not be amended without due scrutiny, and changes should only be made through an enhanced procedure. So, this amendment allows for the superaffirmative procedure to be incorporated into the Bill.

[121] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Antoinette Sandbach. Antoinette Sandbach.

[122] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I have a great deal of sympathy for some of the amendments tabled by Llyr Huws Gruffydd and, indeed, those tabled by William Powell, and I will certainly be supporting some, but not all, of those amendments. I particularly think that William Powell's comments in relation to the scale of environmental integrity, if I can put it that way, is important, and also around the community identity—so, amendment 27D, which I think is particularly important.

09:45

[123] I think amendment 27E, in relation to primary legislation, is key. I think that then gives control back to the National Assembly for Wales, and this is supposed to be not a Government issue, but a community issue, and 'community' on a far wider scale than, perhaps, the Government is looking at. I think, from that point of view, it's been regrettable that there hasn't been more engagement by the Government with opposition parties that are elected to represent their whole communities, including people who don't yet have the vote. I do think it's important that there is greater communication with opposition parties in this regard, and I regret that it hasn't happened.

[124] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. A oes Aelodau eraill yn dymuno siarad? Sori, Julie. Are there any other Members who wish to speak? Sorry, Julie.

[125] **Julie Morgan:** Just to say very briefly, I support the Minister, in particular for bringing in the international element, which is something that I know we lobbied very strongly for in this committee. So, I want to put on record that I strongly support that amendment.

[126] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Reit, galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ymateb i'r ddadl. Right, I call on the Minister to reply to the debate.

[127] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. Again, it would be fair to say this has been one of the most difficult sections that we have been dealing with as Government in terms of the goals and descriptors around this, and we've made what we believe are significant, positive changes to the amendments, following on from recommendations of the committee, and external bodies as well. I do refute the statement by Antoinette Sandbach that engagement with other parties has not taken place. I'm always accessible to having conversations with all Members and external bodies, and, actually, the goals and the principles of the goals have been heavily influenced by external bodies in the drafting of this, and the redrafting too.

[128] I think, again, I have great sympathy with the amendments tabled by Llyr in this process, and, in drafting, we have to draw the line at some point, and say, 'This is where we are; we think this is the most appropriate way forward'. As I said earlier, Chair, at this point in time, we are seeking support for our amendments of the goals in a very positive spirit of change. It isn't prohibitive at the next Stage to make some final adjustments to that, which I will give further consideration to, on the basis of possible further discussions, but, at this Stage, I will not be able to support the principle of the opposition amendments, and I would

ask the group in my name be moved.

[129] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you.

[130] Cyn gwaredu gwelliant 27, mi fyddwn ni'n ymdrin â'r gwelliannau i'r gwelliant hwnnw. Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 27F?

Before disposing of amendment 27, we will deal with the amendments to that amendment. Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 27F?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 27F (Llyr Gruffydd)
Amendment 27F (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[131] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: I move.

[132] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 27F? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, rydym ni'n symud i bleidlais ar welliant 27F. Y rheini sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Dyna ni. Mae gwelliant 27F, felly, heb ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 27F be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we move to a vote on amendment 27F. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Therefore, amendment 27F is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 27F: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 27F: For 3, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 27F.
Amendment 27F not agreed.*

[133] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 27G?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 27G?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 27G (Llyr Gruffydd)
Amendment 27G (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[134] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw, rwy'n cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes, I move.

[135] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 27G? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, mi symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 27G. Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol—hynny yw, yn erbyn y gwelliant, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 27G be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll therefore move to a vote on amendment 27G. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative—that is, against the amendment, in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 27G is not

Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 27G. agreed.

*Gwelliant 27G: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 27G: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 27G.
Amendment 27G not agreed.*

[136] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 27A?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 27A?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 27A (William Powell)
Amendment 27A (William Powell) moved.*

[137] **William Powell:** Yes, Chair.

[138] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 27A? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, rydym ni'n symud i bleidlais ar 27A. Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda—27A. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 27A.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 27A be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll therefore move to a vote on 27A. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Therefore, amendment 27A is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 27A: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 27A: For 3, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 27A.
Amendment 27A not agreed.*

[139] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 27B?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 27B?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 27B (William Powell, gyda chefnogaeth Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 27B (William Powell, supported by Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[140] **William Powell:** Yes.

[141] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 27B? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 27B. Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda. A'r rhai sydd yn erbyn. Mae hynny'n gyfartal, felly rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, neu'n negyddol—hynny yw, yn erbyn y gwelliant—yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 27B.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 27B be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll therefore move to a vote on amendment 27B. Those in favour please raise your hands. And those against. That is tied, therefore I use my casting vote in the negative—that is, against the amendment—in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 27B is not agreed.

Gwelliant 27B: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 27B: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 27B.
Amendment 27B not agreed.*

[142] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 27C?

Alun Ffred Jones: Therefore, William, do you wish to move amendment 27C?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 27C (William Powell).
Amendment 27C (William Powell) moved.*

[143] **William Powell:** Yes, Chair.

[144] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 27C? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Y rheini o blaid gwelliant 27C i godi eu dwylo. A'r rhai sydd yn erbyn. Felly, mae honno'n bleidlais gyfartal. Rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 27C.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 27C be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll therefore move to a vote. Those in favour of amendment 27C please raise your hands. And those against. So, that's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 27C is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 27C: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 27C: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 27C.
Amendment 27C not agreed.*

[145] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 27H?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 27H?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 27H (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 27H (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[146] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes.

[147] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 27H? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 27H. Pawb sydd o blaid 27H i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Tri. Yn erbyn. Pump. Ac yn ymatal. Dau. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 27H.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 27H be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll move to a vote on amendment 27H. Those in favour of 27H please raise your hands. Three. Those against. Five. And those abstaining. Two. Therefore, amendment 27H is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 27H: O blaid 3, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 27H: For 3, Abstain 2, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 27H.
Amendment 27H not agreed.*

[148] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to

chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 27D?

move amendment 27D?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 27D (William Powell).
Amendment 27D (William Powell) moved.*

[149] **William Powell:** Yes, Chair.

[150] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 27D? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Reit, symudwn i bleidlais felly ar 27D. Y rheini o blaid 27D i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda. Pump. Yn erbyn. Pump. Felly, gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 27D.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 27D be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll move to a vote on 27D. Those in favour of 27D please raise your hands. Five. Those against. Five. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 27D is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 27D: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 27D: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 27D.
Amendment 27D not agreed.*

[151] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 27I?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 27I?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 27I (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 27I (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[152] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes.

[153] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 27I? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, rwy'n symud i bleidlais. Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo—27I. Tri. Yn erbyn. Felly, mae gwelliant 27I wedi'i golli; ni dderbyniwyd 27I.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 27I be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] So, we'll move to a vote. Those in favour please raise your hands—27I. Three. Those against. Therefore, amendment 27I is lost; it is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 27I: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 27I: For 3, Abstain 2, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 27I.
Amendment 27I not agreed.

[154] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 27J?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 27J?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 27J (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 27J (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[155] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffudd: Yes.

[156] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 27J? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Fe symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 27J. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo—27J. Tri. Yn erbyn. Saith. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 27J.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 27J be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote on amendment 27J. Those in favour please raise your hands—27J. Three. Those against. Seven. Therefore, amendment 27J is not agreed.

Gwelliant 27J: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 27J: For 3, Abstain 2, Against 7.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 27J.
Amendment 27J not agreed.

[157] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 27E?

Alun Ffred Jones: Therefore, William, do you wish to move amendment 27E?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 27E (William Powell).
Amendment 27E (William Powell) moved.

[158] **William Powell:** Yes.

[159] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 27E? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*]

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 27E be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a

Symudwn i bleidlais felly ar 27E. Pawb o blaid 27E i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda. Pump. Ac yn erbyn. Pump. Felly, gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol—hynny yw, yn erbyn y gwelliant—yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 27E.

vote therefore on 27E. Those in favour of 27E please raise your hands. Five. Those against. Five. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 27E is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 27E: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 27E: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 27E.
Amendment 27E not agreed.*

[160] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 27 heb ei ddiwygio yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 27 without amendment in the name of the Minister.

[161] Rwy'n cymryd bod y Gweinidog—

I take it that the Minister—

[162] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, please.

[163] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 27 heb ei ddiwygio? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Reit, mi symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 27 felly. Y rheini o blaid 27 i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda. Pump. A'r rhai sydd yn erbyn 27 i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda. Pump. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw negyddol—hynny yw, yn erbyn y gwelliant—yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 27.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 27 without amendment be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Right, we'll move to a vote on amendment 27. Those in favour of 27 please raise your hands. Five. And those against 27, please raise your hands. Five. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 27 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 27: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 27: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

George, Russell

Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 27.
Amendment 27 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 28 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 28 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[164] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 28 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 28 in the name of the Minister.

[165] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 28? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, rwy'n symud i bleidlais ar welliant 28. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 28. Y rheini o blaid gwelliant 28, os gwelwch yn dda, i ddangos. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn gwelliant 28, os gwelwch yn dda. Y rhai sydd yn ymatal. Felly, mae gwelliant 28 wedi ei dderbyn.

The question is that amendment 28 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] I therefore move to a vote on amendment 28. The question is that amendment 28 be agreed. Those in favour of 28, please raise your hands. Those against amendment 28, please. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 28 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 28: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 28: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 28.
Amendment 28 agreed.*

[166] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 29—

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 29—

[167] **Carl Sargeant:** Chair. Chair, I do not wish to move amendment 29.

[168] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit. Nid yw'r Gweinidog am imi symud gwelliant 29.

Alun Ffred Jones: Right. The Minister does not wish me to move amendment 29.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 29 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 29 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[169] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, 30B. Os derbynnir gwelliant 30B, bydd gwelliant 30A

Alun Ffred Jones: So, 30B. If amendment 30B is agreed, amendment 30A will fall. The

yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid—. Sori, fe ddylwn i fod wedi gofyn—. Cyn gwaredu gwelliant 30, byddwn yn ymdrin â'r gwelliannau i'r gwelliant hwnnw. Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno gwelliant 30B? Mae'n ddrwg gennyf.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 30B (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 30B (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[170] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

[171] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynir gwelliant 30B, bydd gwelliant 30A yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 30B. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Reit, ac felly, rŷm ni'n symud i bleidlais ar welliant 30B. Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Tri. Y rheini yn erbyn gwelliant 30B. Felly, mae gwelliant 30B wedi methu.

Gwelliant 30B: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 30B: For 3, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

questions is that—. Sorry, I should have asked—. Before disposing of amendment 30, we will deal with the amendments to that amendment. Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 30B? I apologise.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

Alun Ffred Jones: If amendment 30B is agreed, amendment 30A will fall. The question is that amendment 30B be agreed to. Any objection? [Objection.] Right, so we will move to a vote on amendment 30B. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Three. Those against 30B. Therefore, amendment 30B is not agreed.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 30B.
Amendment 30B not agreed.

[172] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, rŷm ni yn symud ymlaen at 30A. William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 30A?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 30A (William Powell).
Amendment 30B (William Powell) moved.

[173] **William Powell:** Move.

[174] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 30A. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 30A. Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 30A.

Alun Ffred Jones: So, we will move on to 30A. William, do you wish to move amendment 30A?

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 30B be agreed to. Any objections? [Objection.] We move to a vote on amendment 30A. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Therefore, amendment 30A is not agreed.

Gwelliant 30A: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 30A: For 3, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 30A.
Amendment 30A not agreed.*

[175] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 30C?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 30C?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 30C (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 30C (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[176] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[177] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 30C. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 30C, felly. Pawb o blaid gwelliant 30C i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Y rhai yn erbyn 30C. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 30C.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 30C be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote on amendment 30C. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against amendment 30C. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment, in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 30C is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 30C: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 30C: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 30C.
Amendment 30C not agreed.*

[178] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 30D?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 30D?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 30D (Llyr Gruffydd).

Amendment 30D (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[179] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[180] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 30D. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 30D. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda. Pawb yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais yn negyddol, hynny yw yn erbyn y gwelliant, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 30D.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 30D be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] So, we'll move to a vote on amendment 30D. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, that is against the amendment, in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 30D is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 30D: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 30D: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 30D.
Amendment 30D not agreed.*

[181] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 30E?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 30E?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 30E (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 30E (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[182] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[183] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 30E. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly, ar 30E. Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 30E.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 30E be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore, on 30E. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Therefore, amendment 30E is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 30E: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 30E: For 3, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 30E.
Amendment 30E not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 30 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 30 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[184] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 30 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 30 heb ei ddiwygio. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Reit, symudwn ni, felly, i bleidlais ar welliant 30. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 30 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, hynny yw yn erbyn y gwelliant, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 30.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 30 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 30 without amendment be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Right, we'll move to a vote on amendment 30. All those in favour of amendment 30, please raise your hands. All those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, that is against the amendment, in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 30 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 30: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 30: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

[185] *Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 30.
Amendment 30 not agreed.*

[186] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n symud ymlaen rŵan at welliant 100. William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 100—y canfed gwelliant?

[187] **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move on now to amendment 100. William, do you wish to move amendment 100—the hundredth amendment?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 100 (William Powell).
Amendment 100 (William Powell) moved.*

[188] **William Powell:** Yes, Chair.

[189] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that the

dylid derbyn y canfed gwelliant. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, fe wnawn ni symud i bleidlais ar y canfed gwelliant, yn enw William Powell.

hundredth amendment be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll therefore move to a vote on the hundredth amendment, in the name of William Powell.

10:00

[190] Pawb o blaid gwelliant 100, os gwelwch yn dda. Pawb sydd yn erbyn gwelliant 100. Ac yn ymatal. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 100.

All those in favour of amendment 100, please. Those against amendment 100. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 100 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 100: O blaid 3, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 100: For 3, Abstain 2, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 100.
Amendment 100 not agreed.*

[191] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 101?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 101?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 101 (William Powell).
Amendment 101 (William Powell) moved.*

[192] **William Powell:** Yes, Chair.

[193] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 101. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 101. Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 101.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 101 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll therefore move to a vote on amendment 101. Those in favour, raise your hands. Those against. Therefore, there's a tied vote, and I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. So, amendment 101 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 101: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 101: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 101.
Amendment 101 not agreed.*

[194] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 102?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 102?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 102 (William Powell).
Amendment 102 (William Powell) moved.*

[195] **William Powell:** Yes, Chair.

[196] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 102. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 102. Pawb o blaid gwelliant 102 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 102.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 102 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll therefore move to a vote on amendment 102. Those in favour of 102, please raise your hands. All those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. So, amendment 102 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 102: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 102: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 102.
Amendment 102 not agreed.*

[197] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 103?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 103?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 103 (William Powell).

Amendment 103 (William Powell) moved.

[198] **William Powell:** Yes, Chair.

[199] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A ddylid derbyn gwelliant 103? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 103. Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda. Pawb sydd yn erbyn i ddangos eu dwylo. Diolch yn fawr. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: Should amendment 103 be agreed to? Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote on amendment 103. All those in favour, please raise your hands. All those against, please show your hands. Thank you. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment, in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 103: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 103: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 103.
Amendment 103 not agreed.*

[200] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 119?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 119?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 119 (Russell George).
Amendment 119 (Russell George) moved.*

[201] **Russell George:** Yes, please.

[202] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 119. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 119. Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, hynny yw, yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 119.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 119 be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] So, we'll move to a vote on amendment 119. All those in favour, please raise your hands. All those against. There is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, that is against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 119 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 119: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 119: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 119.
Amendment 119 not agreed.*

[203] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae gwelliant 163 wedi'i dynnu'n ôl.

Alun Ffred Jones: Amendment 163 has been withdrawn.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 163 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 163 (Llyr Gruffydd) not moved.*

Grŵp 5: Amcanion Llesiant (Gwelliannau 31, 104, 32, 33, 34, 122, 123 ac 124)
Group 5: Well-being Objectives (Amendments 31, 104, 32, 33, 34, 122, 123 and 124)

[204] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, rydym yn symud ymlaen i grŵp 5—amcanion llesiant. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 31 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: So, we move to group 5 relating to wellbeing objectives. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 31 in the name of the Minister.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 31 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 31 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[205] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 31 yn enw'r Gweinidog, a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad am ei welliant ac am y gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp.

Alun Ffred Jones: So, I move amendment 31 in the name of the Minister, and I call on the Minister to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in this group.

[206] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. This is, I assume, group 5.

[207] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Pardon?

[208] **Carl Sargeant:** I assume it's group 5. Yes. I'm just trying to keep check.

[209] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Sorry. No, no. I'm sorry, I probably was—.

[210] **Carl Sargeant:** That's okay. Thank you. Can I speak on these amendments? I understand the desire for Assembly Members, indeed, to set targets for action, but this is, I believe, not the Bill to set targets in law, across such a broad policy area. I urge Members to resist the amendments in the name of the opposition Members.

[211] We look at the amendments tabled. If the concerns for committee are around climate change, in response to the committee, I did propose amendment 27, on which Members voted

against in terms of amendments to the goal—there is a sense of irony there—both in dealing with the causes of climate change and adapting to its effect. I’m also considering how the Environment (Wales) Bill can go further to ensure that climate change is at the heart of the approach of managing our natural resources for current and future generations. Again, I know Members have mentioned that in previous contributions. If anything, Chair, what we want public bodies to target is the achievement of the seven wellbeing goals. I would ask Members to relate and consider the amendments that are being tabled by opposition Members here today.

[212] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, Minister. I Weinidog. Galwaf ar William Powell i call William Powell to speak. siarad.

[213] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I speak to my amendment 104. Consistent with earlier remarks, this simply makes it clearer in terms of the way in which the goals are balanced, one with another, and we feel that our amendment would add value in that regard.

[214] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I Galwaf ar Antoinette Sandbach i siarad. call on Antoinette Sandbach to speak.

[215] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Yes. I move amendments 122, 123 and 124. These amendments have been tabled, effectively, to remove the ability for Welsh Ministers to review or revise the wellbeing goals. What that does is: that gives the ability back to the National Assembly for Wales, and it gives the authority for the National Assembly of Wales to amend or revise the wellbeing goals by their normal process, which would be through primary legislation. During the evidence-gathering process, concerns were raised by stakeholders that the proposed arrangements for changing the wellbeing goals do not allow sufficient scrutiny of the changes. The RSPB suggested that a superaffirmative procedure for approving changes to the goals would be an appropriate alternative in paragraph 81, but of course, the Welsh Government has voted against amendment 119, so that superaffirmative procedure, in effect, hasn’t gone through. The organisation, the RSPB, stated in written evidence:

[216] ‘any changes (amendment, addition or removal) to one or more of the six well-being goals should be conditional upon detailed Assembly scrutiny akin to that of primary legislative procedure to ensure democratic accountability’.

[217] The Welsh Local Government Association also supported this approach. The committee agreed that wellbeing goals should not be amended without due scrutiny, and changes should only be made through an enhanced procedure. That was recommendation 14 of our report. So, that’s why amendments 122, 123 and 124 have been tabled, and I would ask Members to support those amendments.

[218] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Are there A oes Aelodau eraill sy’n dymuno siarad? other Members who wish to speak? No. I call Nid oes. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ymateb i’r on the Minister to reply to the debate. ddadl.

[219] **Carl Sargeant:** I have noted the Members’ comments as I referred to at the outset, Chair. We believe that our amendments are very clear in this process. We will not be supporting the amendments tabled by Antoinette or William Powell at this stage of the proceedings.

[220] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Weinidog, a hoffech chi symud i bleidlais ar Minister, do you wish to proceed to a vote on

welliant 31?

amendment 31?

[221] **Carl Sargeant:** No. I don't wish to move amendment 31. We base this on—. If we are right, Chair—and perhaps you can clarify this for us—amendment 26 wasn't agreed and amendment 31 is a consequential of that. Could you clarify that for us?

[222] **Alun Ffred Jones:** We'll have a brief adjournment so that we just check this, and then we'll reconvene in, what, 10 minutes?

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:08 a 10:18.
The meeting adjourned between 10:08 and 10:18.*

[223] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit, fe wnawn ni ailagor y pwyllgor. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right, we will resume this meeting.

[224] Minister, what I've been told is the only pre-emptions are the ones noted on the voting list. So, I'll be asking the same question about whether you wish to move the amendments.

[225] Felly, gan edrych ar welliant 31, a ydych yn dymuno mynd i bleidlais, Weinidog? **Therefore, turning to amendment 31, do you wish to move to a vote, Minister?**

[226] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

*Tynnwyd gwelliant 31 yn ôl gyda chaniatâd y pwyllgor.
Amendment 31 withdrawn by leave of the committee.*

[227] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Os felly, rydym yn symud ymlaen at welliant 104. William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 104? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Therefore, we move on to amendment 104. William, do you wish to move amendment 104?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 104 (William Powell).
Amendment 104 moved (William Powell).*

[228] **William Powell:** Yes.

[229] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 104. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn at bleidlais ar welliant 104. Y rhai sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai yn erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant 104, felly, heb gael ei dderbyn. **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, the question is that amendment 104 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] So, we'll move to a vote on amendment 104. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Therefore, amendment 104 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 104: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 104: For 3, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.

Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 104.
Amendment 104 not agreed.*

[230] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 32 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A ydych eisiau symud y gwelliant, Weinidog?

Alun Ffred Jones: Amendment 32 in the name of the Minister. Do you wish to move the amendment, Minister?

[231] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 32 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 32 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[232] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, rydym yn symud i welliant 33. A ydych chi'n dymuno symud y gwelliant?

Alun Ffred Jones: Therefore, we move to amendment 33. Do you wish to move the amendment?

[233] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 33 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 33 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[234] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 34 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A ydych chi'n dymuno symud y gwelliant?

Alun Ffred Jones: Amendment 34 in the name of the Minister. Do you wish to move the amendment?

[235] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 34 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 34 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[236] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A gwelliant 35. A ydych chi'n dymuno symud y gwelliant, Weinidog?

Alun Ffred Jones: And amendment 35. Do you wish to move the amendment, Minister?

[237] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 35 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 35 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[238] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Dyna ni; diolch yn fawr. Felly, rydym yn symud ymlaen i welliant 105. William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig y gwelliant?

Alun Ffred Jones: Okay; thank you very much. So, we move on to amendment 105. William do you wish to move the amendment?

[239] **William Powell:** Yes, Chair.

[240] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit, gwelliant 105, rydym yn pleidleisio—. Sori. A oes—

Alun Ffred Jones: Right, amendment 105, we are voting—. Sorry. Does—

[241] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Sorry, Chair, before we go on to that, can I just check a point of principle? Is it possible for other Members to move amendments that have been tabled in

the name of other parties?

[242] **Alun Ffred Jones:** In terms of the Minister's amendments, I am the only person who is able to do so.

[243] William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 105? William, do you wish to move amendment 105?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 105 (William Powell).
Amendment 105 (William Powell) moved.*

[244] **William Powell:** Yes, Chair.

[245] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 105? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, rydym yn symud i bleidlais ar welliant 105. Y rheiny o blaid i godi eu dwylo. A'r rhai sydd yn erbyn. Oherwydd bod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, hynny yw, yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir gwelliant 105.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 105 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll therefore move to a vote on amendment 105. Those in favour please raise your hands. And those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, that is, against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 105 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 105: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 105: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 105.
Amendment 105 not agreed.*

[246] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 122? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 122?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 122 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 122 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[247] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I move.

[248] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 122? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 122. Y rhai

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 122 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] So, we'll move to a vote on amendment 122. Those in favour

sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. A'r rhai sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, hynny yw, yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir gwelliant 122.

please raise your hands. And those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, that is, against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 122 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 122: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 122: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 122.
Amendment 122 not agreed.*

[249] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 123? to move amendment 123?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 123 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 123 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[250] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I move.

[251] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 123? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 123. Y rheiny o blaid i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda. A'r rhai sydd yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, hynny yw, yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 123.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 123 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote on amendment 123. Those in favour please raise your hands. And those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote in the negative, that is, against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 123 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 123: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 123: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 123.

Amendment 123 not agreed.

[252] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 124? to move amendment 124?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 124 (Antoinette Sandbach).

Amendment 124 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.

[253] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I move.

[254] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 124? A oes unrhyw amendment 124 be agreed to. Does any wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid 124 i ddangos, vote. Those in favour of 124 please raise your os gwelwch yn dda. A'r rhai sydd yn erbyn. hands. And those against. As there is a tied Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n vote, I use my casting vote in the negative defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 124. 124 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 124: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 124: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 124.

Amendment 124 not agreed.

Grŵp 6: Dangosyddion a Thargedau Cenedlaethol (Gwelliannau 106, 125, 164, 165, 107, 126, 127, 128, 166, 167, 129, 130, 131, 132, 133, 134, 135 a 108)

Group 6: National Indicators and Targets (Amendments 106, 125, 164, 165, 107, 126, 127, 128, 166, 167, 129, 130, 131, 132, 133, 134, 135 and 108)

[255] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n symud **Alun Ffred Jones:** We now move to group 6 rŵan at grŵp 6, dangosyddion cenedlaethol a on national indicators and targets. There is a thargedau. Mae rhes o welliannau yn y fan long list of amendments here. The lead hyn. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant amendment in the group is amendment 106 yn enw William Powell. Galwaf ar the name of William Powell. I call on

William Powell i gynnig gwelliant 106, i siarad am ei welliant ac am y gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp. William Powell. William Powell to move amendment 106, to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in this group. William Powell.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 106 (William Powell).
Amendment 106 (William Powell) moved.*

[256] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I speak to our amendments in this section. Amendment 106—this and our related amendments are all about the insertion of clear climate change targets on the face of the Bill. It is our contention that you can't talk about the wellbeing of future generations without engaging explicitly with climate change, and the urgent need to tackle it. It is clearly the single biggest threat to future generations. In that context, we feel that what we're inserting here in terms of targets will bring considerable strength and value.

[257] I also speak in favour of amendment 107, again relating to the insertion of 'and targets'.

[258] And finally, amendment 108 again is based on a similar rationale. We think that we need to have explicit reference there to the climate change targets if this is going to have the teeth that are going to make it a valuable piece of legislation. And we also are supportive of a number of other amendments that have been tabled by Antoinette Sandbach and would seek your support.

[259] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn, Diolch yn fawr iawn. Galwaf ar Antoinette Sandbach i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right, thank you very much. I call on Antoinette Sandbach to speak.

[260] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I am speaking in support initially of amendments 125, 126, 127 and 128. These amendments relate to the national indicators and, in effect, increase the oversight of the National Assembly over national indicators. They require a draft of the indicators to be brought before the National Assembly and approved by it before they are published. This allows the elected representatives of the whole of Wales to consider the draft indicators and not just those that form the Government, in effect. Amendments 129, 130, 131, 132 and 133 have been tabled to remove the ability of the Ministers to review or revise the national indicators at any time. Where the indicators have been revised, our amendments require that a draft must be laid before the National Assembly and approved by it before the indicators are published. Again, that will increase the democratic accountability and will allow everybody to feed in to the indicators.

[261] Amendment 134 specifically includes the Office for National Statistics within the list of organisations that the Minister must consult before preparing the national indicators or any revision of the indicators. Glenn Everett, the director of the measuring national wellbeing programme for the Office for National Statistics, told the committee that it would be beneficial if the indicators were granted national statistics status and the benefit of this would be

[262] 'the independence of the UK Statistics Authority, which stamps them as a robust set of indicators. It can mean that the statistics meet identified user needs; are well explained and readily accessible; are produced according to sound methods; and are managed impartially and objectively in the public interest'.

[263] Now, this Bill is stated to be all about the public interest—the interest of current and future generations—and it seems to me that, if we are going to have indicators, it is vital that

those are impartial and objective and managed in the public interest. This was recommendation 18 of the committee report. We also heard evidence from the ONS that they have put a substantial amount of research time into wellbeing indicators and, in my view, it would be good for the Welsh Government to adopt that robust impartial set of indicators and support the inclusion of the Office for National Statistics in there.

[264] My final amendment is amendment 135. This amendment ensures that a resolution to approve national indicators has no effect unless at least two thirds of the Members voting support the motion. Now, the reason why this has been put in is again to ensure that there is buy-in from the majority of people who are elected to speak up for all parts of Wales, and it seems to me that if there is a two-thirds majority in the Assembly there will be that buy-in and that engagement with all parties and not just the Government; there will be cross-party engagement with this process, and that strengthens the Bill.

[265] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Llyr Gruffydd i siarad. Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[266] **Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. I'll be speaking to amendments 164, 165, 166 and 167. Amendments 164 and 166 add a reference to the need for national targets for the very same reasons as articulated by Bill Powell. We need, I think, measurable outcomes set below the goals. Indicators tell us where we are, but targets, I believe, tell us where we need to be or where we want to be, and I think that that would strengthen the Bill substantially. Amendment 167 then defines a target as something that's expressed as a value or characteristic that can be measured quantitatively and qualitatively, and it also specifies that the Welsh Government must set a national target in respect of greenhouse gas emissions—not that the target itself will appear on the face of the Bill, of course, but that there's a duty to set those targets. Amendment 165 strengthens section 11(1)(a), so that the national indicators published by the Welsh Government 'must' rather than 'may' be applied for the purpose of measuring progress towards the achievement of the wellbeing goals, so I'd urge you all to support those four amendments of mine.

10:30

[267] I would like to speak briefly to amendment 108 by Bill Powell. I certainly support the need for statutory targets on climate change, and I understand where those targets that you're seeking to insert in the Bill have come from, although I think that there's a whole debate to be had as well around whether those are now still sufficient in the current context that we find ourselves in—but that's a whole other debate of course. But I honestly believe that we need a much more deliberate piece of legislation to establish such targets and that we shouldn't be doing that through an amendment here to the Bill, so I won't be supporting 108.

[268] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Diolch yn fawr. A oes Aelodau eraill sy'n dymuno siarad? Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right. Thank you very much. Are there any other Members who wish to speak? I therefore call on the Minister to speak.

[269] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. Again, I recognise the Members' concerns around targets. I've been very clear around this Bill and the process and the broad range of how the Bill interacts across Government and not just on environmental issues. I recognise the points that Llyr and Bill made and the well-meaning they have behind these amendments, but it is something that we will not be seeking to support at this juncture. I am unclear about William Powell's amendments and how they are to be made consistent with our responsibilities already under the Climate Change Act of 2008. It is not clear how they would work in that process. I am also considering, as I said earlier, how the environment Bill will reflect targets and challenges in the near future and will be subject to, of course, the principle of sustainable

development laid down as in this Bill.

[270] On amendment 165 in the name of Llyr Gruffydd, I am supportive of Llyr's amendment 165. It will make it, I believe, crystal clear that indicators must be applied for the purpose of measuring the wellbeing goals, as currently accepted. On the approval of indicators, as laid by Antoinette Sandbach, if I may, Chair, section 11 of the Bill already requires the Welsh Ministers to lay a copy of the national indicators before the National Assembly and also when they are revised. Section 11(7) of the Bill requires Welsh Ministers to consult on that before national indicators are published, and of course it is already within the gift of the National Assembly, and it has the power, to express their views on anything that the Welsh Government does. This would include the national indicators, and it is already within the remit of the National Assembly for them to do so. It would be inappropriate for any Government to interfere with the Standing Orders of the Welsh Assembly process and that of the Commission, and they already have the remit to do that. Therefore, we believe that that is unnecessary.

[271] I was interested in Antoinette Sandbach's comments regarding the Office for National Statistics. May I say that we believe that amendment 134 is technically incorrect? It doesn't reflect the devolution settlement and the responsibilities of the Welsh Government at all. In fact, the reference is also technically flawed on the name; it is the Office 'for' National Statistics, not 'of'. I would urge the Member to redress this at the next stage and we will give that further consideration. However, we are in constant discussion with the ONS at this point on indicators to give committee their confidence around that.

[272] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much, Weinidog. Galwaf ar William Powell i Minister. I call on William Powell to reply to ymateb i'r ddadl. the debate.

[273] **William Powell:** Thank you, Chair, and thank you, Minister, for that response. I just really need to reiterate what I said earlier, that climate change targets for us are absolutely essential on the face of the Bill, if it is to achieve what the wider public of Wales have charged us with achieving. I'm disappointed that you are unable to support the amendment that I've lead on at this time. I hope that we'll be able to achieve some greater consensus as this process goes forward. I would ask that we receive support for our amendments.

[274] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn, diolch yn fawr. William, a ydych yn dymuno symud i bleidlais ar welliant 106? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right, thank you. So, William, do you wish to proceed to a vote on amendment 106?

[275] **William Powell:** Yes.

[276] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 106? A oes yna unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, rydym yn symud i bleidlais ar welliant 106. Y rhai o blaid gwelliant 106 i ddangos. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir y gwelliant. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 106 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll therefore move to a vote on amendment 106. Those in favour of 106, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 106 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 106: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 106: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 106.
Amendment 106 not agreed.*

[277] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 125? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 125?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 125 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 125 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[278] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Yes.

[279] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 125? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 125. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 125? Rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir gwelliant 125.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 125 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote on amendment 125. The question is that amendment 125 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 125 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 125: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 125: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 125.
Amendment 125 not agreed.*

[280] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 164? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 164?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 164 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 164 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[281] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes.

[282] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 164? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly, ar welliant 164. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 164? Rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir gwelliant 164.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 164 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore, on amendment 164. The question is that amendment 164 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 164 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 164: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 164: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 164.
Amendment 164 not agreed.*

[283] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 165. A ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 165?

Alun Ffred Jones: Amendment 165. Do you wish to move amendment 165?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 165 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 165 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[284] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[285] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 165? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Na. Felly, Derbyniwyd gwelliant 165.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 165 be agreed to. Does any Member object? Therefore, amendment 165 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 165 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 165 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[286] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 107?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 107?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 107 (William Powell).
Amendment 107 (William Powell) moved.

[287] **William Powell:** Yes.

[288] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 107? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 107? Rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Y rhai sydd yn ymatal. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 107.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 107 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. The question is that amendment 107 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 107 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 107: O blaid 3, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 107: For 3, Abstain 2, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
 Morgan, Julie
 Price, Gwyn R.
 Rathbone, Jenny
 Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
 Sandbach, Antoinette

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 107.
Amendment 107 not agreed.

[289] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 126?

Alun Ffred Jones: Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 126?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 126 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 126 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.

[290] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[291] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 126? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 126? Rheini o blaid i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir gwelliant 126.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 126 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 126 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 126 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 126: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 126: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 126.
Amendment 126 not agreed.*

[292] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 127? to move amendment 127?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 127 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 127 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[293] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[294] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 127. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 127? Rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir gwelliant 127.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 127 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 127 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 127 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 127: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 127: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 127.
Amendment 127 not agreed.*

[295] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish

ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 128? to move amendment 128?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 128 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 128 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[296] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[297] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 128? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 128? Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd y gwelliant—gwelliant 128.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 128 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 128 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed—amendment 128.

*Gwelliant 128: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 128: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 128.
Amendment 128 not agreed.*

[298] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 166?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 166?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 166 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 166 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[299] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[300] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 166? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 166? Rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir gwelliant 166.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 166 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 166 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 166 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 166: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 166: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 166.
Amendment 166 not agreed.*

[301] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 167?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 167?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 167 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 167 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[302] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes.

[303] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 167? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 167? Rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai sydd yn erbyn. Y rhai sydd yn ymatal. Ni dderbynnir gwelliant 167.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 167 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. The question is that amendment 167 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Amendment 167 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 167: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 167: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Powell, William
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 167.
Amendment 167 not agreed.*

[304] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 129?

Antoinette Sandbach: Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 129?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 129 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 129 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[305] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[306] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 129? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 129? Rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir gwelliant 129.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 129 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. The question is that amendment 129 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 129 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 129: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 129: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 129.
Amendment 129 not agreed.*

[307] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 130? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 130?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 130 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 130 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[308] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Yes.

[309] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 130? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 130? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 130.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 130 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. The question is that amendment 130 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 130 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 130: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 130: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 130.
Amendment 130 not agreed.*

[310] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 131? to move amendment 131?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 131 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 131 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[311] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[312] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 131? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 131? Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos eu dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 131.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 131 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. The question is that amendment 131 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 131 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 131: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 131: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 131.
Amendment 131 not agreed.*

[313] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 132? to move amendment 132?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 132 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 132 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.

[314] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[315] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A ddylid derbyn gwelliant 132 yw'r cwestiwn. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 132? Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 132.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 132 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 132 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. The vote is tied, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 132 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 132: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 132: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
 Gruffydd, Llyr
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Powell, William
 Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
 Morgan, Julie
 Price, Gwyn R.
 Rathbone, Jenny
 Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 132.
Amendment 132 not agreed.

[316] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 133? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 133?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 133 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 133 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.

[317] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[318] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 133? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 133? Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir gwelliant 133.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 133 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 133 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. The vote is tied, so I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 133 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 133: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 133: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 133.
Amendment 133 not agreed.*

[319] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 134? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 134?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 134 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 134 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[320] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[321] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 134? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 134? Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir gwelliant 134.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 134 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 134 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. The vote is tied, so I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 134 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 134: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 134: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 134.
Amendment 134 not agreed.*

[322] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n cynnig gwelliant 135? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 135?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 135 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 135 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[323] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[324] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 135? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 135? Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir gwelliant 135. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 135 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 135 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. The vote is tied, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 135 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 135: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 135: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 135.
Amendment 135 not agreed.*

[325] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 108? **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 108?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 108 (William Powell).
Amendment 108 (William Powell) moved.*

[326] **William Powell:** Move.

[327] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 108? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 108? Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Ni dderbynnir gwelliant 108. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 108 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 108 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Amendment 108 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 108: O blaid 1, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 9.
Amendment 108: For 1, Abstain 0, Against 9.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
 George, Russell
 Gruffydd, Llyr
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Morgan, Julie
 Price, Gwyn R.
 Rathbone, Jenny
 Sandbach, Antoinette
 Watson, Joyce

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 108.
Amendment 108 not agreed.

Grŵp 7: Adroddiad Tueddiadau Tebygol y Dyfodol (Gwelliannau 168, 169, 73 a 170)
Group 7: Future Trends Report (Amendments 168, 169, 73 and 170)

[328] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym yn symud ymlaen rŵan i grŵp 7—adroddiad tueddiadau'r dyfodol. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 168 yn enw Llyr Gruffydd. Galwaf ar Llyr Gruffydd i gynnig gwelliant 168, ac i siarad am ei welliant ac am y gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp.

Alun Ffred Jones: We move now to group 7, relating to future trends reports. The lead amendment in this group is amendment 168 in the name of Llyr Gruffydd. I call on Llyr Gruffydd to move amendment 168, and to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in this group.

10:45

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 168 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 168 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[329] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. This series of amendments of mine seek to strengthen the robustness of the future trends report. On amendments 168 and 169, these additions would ensure that future trends reports are based on sound science and cover the full breadth of matters that are important in their production.

[330] Amendment 170 inserts a subsection that strengthens the process of formulating the future trends report; for example, ensuring that public bodies gather and publish evidence on the economic, social and environmental wellbeing of Wales, and also requires them to take advice from the future generations commissioner and other expert advisers as well on likely future trends. So, as I say, it's pretty straightforward; it's about strengthening the robustness of the reports.

[331] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn, diolch yn fawr. A oes unrhyw Aelodau eraill sy'n dymuno siarad? Antoinette Sandbach.

Alun Ffred Jones: Right, thank you. Do any other Members wish to speak? Antoinette Sandbach.

[332] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Yes, I would like to speak in support of these amendments. I think it's very important to have evidence-based policy making, which is effectively what these amendments call for, and they strengthen the future trends reports. So, I think it's very important that these amendments are incorporated in the Bill, and, in particular, it will provide valuable evidence going forward.

[333] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes unrhyw Aelodau eraill yn dymuno siarad. Na? Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Do any other Members wish to speak? No? I call on the Minister to speak.

[334] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I listened carefully to the comments made by Llyr and Antoinette Sandbach. I certainly agree with the proposals and the intent behind these, but I believe that this is unnecessary in that the drafting that we already have is inclusive for this. The existing provisions are already implicit. I'm concerned about one of the lines in the drafting of the amendments, which references expert advice. I think this actually may have unintended consequences, whereas this would be restrictive to gaining evidence from bodies who aren't perhaps considered professional, but also do have added value to influencing the future trends report and evidence submitted to that. And, therefore, this will be something that would concern me.

[335] What I will do is give further consideration at a further stage to looking at the drafting if it needs to be clarified, but we did do this on the basis of a recommendation from the committee report about how we would look at this to describe it better with lawful content.

[336] Can I turn to amendment 73, which will specifically require the Welsh Ministers to consider the current predicted impact of climate change and climate risk assessment when preparing the future trends reports? We've made this amendment again on the basis of the committee recommendations, and we are seeking support from committee.

[337] On amendment 170, as alluded to by Members, again, the Bill already provides the establishment of a future generations commissioner. The commissioner will be required to provide the support needed to specific public bodies, including making sure that they are well informed about matters relating to the issues around the wellbeing of Wales. Again, this is implicit in the drafting of the Bill currently, and we don't think these amendments are therefore necessary.

[338] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn, diolch yn fawr iawn, Weiniog. Galwaf ar Llyr Gruffydd i ymateb i'r ddadl. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay, thank you very much, Minister. I call on Llyr Gruffydd to reply to the debate.

[339] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. I note the Minister's comments. He tells us that the drafting is inclusive, yet you propose your own amendment to add to the list and the breadth of evidence to be taken, so I'm not sure, you know, whether it's inclusive enough maybe. So, I will still be moving my amendments. I've no objection to Government amendment 73, certainly, but I'd urge Members to support the other amendments as well.

[340] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Llyr, hoffech chi symud i bleidlais ar welliant 168? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Llyr, do you wish to proceed to a vote on amendment 168?

[341] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ie, plis. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Yes, please.

[342] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 168? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais felly. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 168? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 168 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote therefore. The question is that amendment 168 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in

â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 168. accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 168 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 168: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 168: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 168.
Amendment 168 not agreed.*

[343] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 169?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 169?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 169 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 169 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[344] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[345] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 169? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 169? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn i godi eu dwylo. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 169.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 169 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 169 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against, please raise your hands. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 169 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 169: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 169: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing

Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 169.
Amendment 169 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 73 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 73 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[346] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 73. Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 73 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: Amendment 73. I move amendment 73 in the name of the Minister.

[347] Os derbynir gwelliant 73, bydd gwelliant 170 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 73. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Rydym yn symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 73? Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb yn erbyn. Ymatal. Felly, mae gwelliant 73 wedi'i basio.

If amendment 73 is agreed, amendment 170 falls. The question is that amendment 73 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote this. The question is that amendment 73 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining, I'm sorry. Therefore, amendment 73 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 73: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 73: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 73.
Amendment 73 agreed.*

[348] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynir gwelliant 73, bydd gwelliant 170 yn methu. Felly, mae 170 wedi mynd.

Alun Ffred Jones: If amendment 73 is agreed, amendment 170 falls. So, amendment 170 has fallen.

*Methodd gwelliant 170 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 170 (Llyr Gruffydd) fell.*

Grŵp 8: Swyddogaeth Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru (Gwelliannau 99 a 98) Group 8: Role of the Auditor General for Wales (Amendments 99 and 98)

[349] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Grŵp 8: rôl Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, gwelliannau 99, 98. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp hwn yw gwelliant 99 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: We turn to group 8: the role of the Auditor General for Wales, amendments 99 and 98. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 99 in the name of the Minister.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 99 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 99 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[350] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, cynigiaf **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, I move amendment

welliant 99 a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad 99 and call on the Minister to speak to the
am y gwelliannau yn y grŵp hwn. amendments in this group.

[351] Before you start—

[352] Rwyf wedi cael cyngor gwahanol I have received some alternative advice on
ynghlŷn â symud gwelliannau. the moving of amendments.

[353] I'll read it out as it stands in the Standing Orders—and I apologise for this:

[354] 'If a Member who tabled an amendment does not move the amendment when that
amendment comes to be debated, the amendment may be moved: (i) in a committee
considering Stage 2 proceedings, by a member of that committee'.

[355] Is that the relevant—

[356] **Mr Griffiths:** Yes.

[357] **Alun Ffred Jones:** But is the Minister a member?

[358] **Mr Griffiths:** He's a Member of the Assembly.

[359] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A Member of the Assembly. All right. So, it's technically
possible for another Member of the committee to move. Minister?

[360] **Carl Sargeant:** Just to clarify that, I'm a Member of the Assembly, so do I get voting
rights on this committee?

[361] **Ms Hunt:** No.

[362] **Carl Sargeant:** On what basis, if my position here is as a Government member and an
Assembly Member? Can you clarify that, please?

[363] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Well, that is not—

[364] **Antoinette Sandbach:** You're here as the Minister.

[365] **Carl Sargeant:** How can you move my amendment, then?

[366] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unless you're a member of the committee, you do not have
voting rights. That is not peculiar to you, Minister. Apparently, it is in Standing Orders,
though I admit that I haven't read all of them. But, I do not wish this to happen; I'm not trying
to be difficult here. I was corrected, so I'm merely making it clear. Sorry, Minister. I ask you
now to speak to amendments 99 and 98.

[367] **Carl Sargeant:** I'm grateful, Chair, and thank you for your clarification. I have
brought amendments 98 and 99 forward to respond to Stage 1, about the lack of the explicit
role of the Auditor General for Wales in relation to the Bill. These amendments, I believe,
fulfil the policy note I agreed with the Auditor General for Wales and shared with the
committee before Christmas. I understand that the Auditor General for Wales is content with
the amendments I have tabled. I would ask you to move them.

[368] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much.
Unrhyw Aelod arall eisiau siarad? Jenny Are there any other Members who wish to
Rathbone. speak? Jenny Rathbone.

[369] **Jenny Rathbone:** It is just to say that I think it is very important that we have heard what the auditor general has to say, and this amendment enables him or her to carry out their examinations in line with the future generations Bill.

[370] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right, thank you. Do you wish to respond?

[371] **Carl Sargeant:** Nothing to add.

[372] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, a ydych chi'n dymuno symud i bleidlais ar welliant 99, Weinidog? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Minister, do you wish to proceed to a vote on amendment 99?

[373] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, please.

[374] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 99. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Reit, fe symudwn ni i bleidlais, felly, ar welliant 99. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 99? Pawb sydd o blaid, dangoswch. Ac yn erbyn, ac yn ymatal. Mae 99 wedi ei basio. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 99 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] Right, so we'll move to a vote on amendment 99. The question is that amendment 99 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against, and those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 99 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 99: O blaid 6, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 99: For 6, Abstain 4, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Jones, Alun Ffred
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 99.
Amendment 99 agreed.*

**Grŵp 9: Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol—Trefniadau Penodi a Chyfrifyddu
(Gwelliannau 109, 136, 171, 118, 53, 54, 55, 60, 19 a 20)
Group 9: Future Generations Commissioner—Appointment and Accounting
Arrangements (Amendments 109, 136, 171, 118, 53, 54, 55, 60, 19 and 20)**

[375] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym yn symud i grŵp 9, sy'n ymwneud â threfniadau cyfrifyddu a phenodi comisiynydd cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw 109 yn enw William Powell. Galwaf ar William Powell i gynnig gwelliant 109 ac i siarad am ei welliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp—William Powell.

Alun Ffred Jones: We now move to group 9, relating to the appointment and accounting arrangements for the future generations commissioner. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 109 in the name of William Powell. I call on William Powell to move amendment 109 and to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in this group—William Powell.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 109 (William Powell).

Amendment 109 (William Powell) moved.

[376] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I speak to amendment 109 and subsequently 118 in this section. This, from my perspective, is a very important amendment indeed, and it reflects a theme that has been very central to the committee's consideration of this from the very start. The independence of the future generations commissioner—the true independence of that person—from Welsh Government is absolutely crucial to the carrying out of that role and to safeguarding us from, maybe, some future Government that might wish to undertake a whole series of risky policies that would undermine the wellbeing of future generations. We think that the role of the Assembly should be enshrined at the very heart of the appointment process and that is the context within which I would ask for your support on this amendment.

[377] When it comes to amendment 118, this is very much in line with the committee recommendation that we arrived at and agreed unanimously. We believe that the Bill should be amended in order to change the length of the commissioner's term of office. It is our view that the commissioner should be appointed for a term of seven years with no reappointment. This would allow the commissioner sufficient time to establish him or herself in that role and to oversee the longer term changes, and, of course, that would straddle any one term of the Assembly, which is really important. It would also bring a level of consistency with the appointment of the Children's Commissioner for Wales. The single-term appointment would also significantly enhance, in our view, the actual and perceived independence of the commissioner in carrying out those central functions.

[378] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn, diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar Antoinette Sandbach i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right, thank you very much. I call on Antoinette Sandbach to speak.

[379] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Well, can I say, in relation to amendment 118, that I agree with the proposals of the Liberal Democrats in this regard? I know that there is substantial stakeholder support for that amendment, which, effectively, requests that the appointment is for a single term and it spans elections. I think that's important to guarantee the independence of the future generations commissioner.

[380] I speak to amendment 136. This amendment concerns the appointment of the future generations commissioner. It removes the requirement for the commissioner to be appointed by Welsh Ministers and replaces it with an alternative requirement that specifies that the First Minister is to appoint the commissioner on the nomination of the National Assembly. The majority of stakeholders that provided evidence on the Bill agreed that the commissioner should be independent and impartial. It was felt that the best way to achieve this would be if the role was appointed by the National Assembly, rather than Welsh Government. Professor Robert Lee, representing the UK Environmental Law Association said,

[381] 'I am sure that we would all agree that what will matter is that the commissioner is independent, impartial and free from political interference. We simply thought that that might be better achieved—both for the commissioner and possibly for the advisory panel—if decisions, for example, in extremis, to dismiss the commissioner, were to be taken by the Assembly rather than by the Ministers.'

[382] Witnesses representing environmental groups unanimously agreed that the commissioner should be appointed by the Assembly in order to ensure their independence, especially as part of the role would involve advising on, and potentially criticising, the Welsh Government's decisions. So, I would urge your support for amendment 136.

[383] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar Llyr Gruffydd i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I call on Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[384] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Ni fyddaf yn cynnig gwelliant 171. Rwyf wedi ystyried y mater yma ymhellach ac wedi dod i'r casgliad bod yna welliannau eraill sydd yn rhoi rôl gryfach a mwy ystyrion i'r Cynulliad o fewn y broses o benodi'r comisiynydd. Felly, mi fyddaf i'n cefnogi'r rheini a ddim yn symud gwelliant 171.

Llyr Gruffydd: Thank you, Chair. I won't be moving amendment 171. I have considered this further and come to the conclusion that there are other amendments that give a stronger and more meaningful role to the Assembly within the process of appointing the commissioner, and therefore I will be supporting those rather than moving amendment 171.

11:00

[385] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes yna unrhyw Aelod arall sy'n dymuno siarad ar y mater yma? Jenny Rathbone.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you. Are there any other Members who wish to speak on this matter? Jenny Rathbone.

[386] **Jenny Rathbone:** I'm disappointed to hear that Llyr Huws Gruffydd is not minded to move amendment 171. Am I able to move it in his stead?

[387] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Yes.

[388] **Jenny Rathbone:** Okay, because I think it's very important that commissioners should be independent and free of political interference, but we just appointed a very excellent children's commissioner under the existing process that the Government proposes this post should be appointed under. I'm sure that person will be entirely independent and free of political interference. And I recall that, when I was a member of the Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee, we were able to have a scrutiny session with the proposed Public Services Ombudsman for Wales prior to the formalisation of that appointment, so I think that amendment 171 enables the relevant committee, which would be this committee or it in another form, to have a scrutiny session with any proposed candidate, and that would give the Assembly a way of ensuring that that person was indeed independent and free of political interference. So, I would hope that we would be able to consider amendment 171.

[389] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn, diolch yn fawr. A oes unrhyw Aelod arall am siarad? Galwaf y Gweinidog i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Right, thank you very much. Does any other Member wish to speak? I call the Minister to speak.

[390] **Carl Sargeant:** I recall from the earlier stages of this committee, Chair, the very differing views on the appointment process of the commissioner. I have given this some considerable thought, and based upon the amendments that were laid and tabled before us today I was very sympathetic to Llyr Huws Gruffydd's approach to the transparency of the relationship in the appointment of a commissioner. I do believe that the transparency process of commissioners and their actions with Government are very clear. We have some excellent commissioners and that has not been compromised, I believe, to date and I do not believe that will be the case in the future based on the principles that Llyr, in this amendment, is bringing forward. Therefore, I would be minded to support his proposals and reject the other members of the committee's amendments to this.

[391] Turning to Government amendments 53, 54 and 55, I would ask for all the Government amendments in this group to be moved by you. This is around the issue of setting the term out of the commissioner and the cycle under which they are appointed, reappointment proposals et cetera in relation to the commissioner, which gives flexibility but again with the appropriateness applied to commissioners and consistency with others. I would

ask you, therefore, to move these amendments in my name.

[392] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. William Powell i ymateb. **William Powell** to reply.

[393] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I very much welcome the movement that the Minister has shown in responding to amendment 171, but I certainly wouldn't wish to impugn anything in terms of the new children's commissioner with regard to the current arrangements. However, I'm very pleased that Llyr Gruffydd, the original proposer of 171, actually sees the merit in our stronger amendment, and particularly amendment 118 with regard to the term of office, which, after all, reflects the views that we arrived at collectively as a committee at Stage 1 in our report. So, I think that it's that mature reflection that Llyr has gone through in deciding not to move his own amendment, notwithstanding, as I said, the appreciation of the Minister moving in our direction. I therefore would ask Members across the committee to give support to our amendment, because I think it is sending out a very powerful message about the need for absolute independence and clarity of that independence of the future generations commissioner. So, I would seek support for our amendment.

[394] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. William, a ydych chi'n dymuno symud i William, do you wish to proceed to a vote on bleidlais ar welliant 109? amendment 109?

[395] **William Powell:** Yes.

[396] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynnir **Alun Ffred Jones:** If amendment 109 is gwelliant 109 bydd gwelliant 136 yn methu. agreed, amendment 136 falls. The question is Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant that amendment 109 be agreed to. Does any 109? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly, vote, therefore, on amendment 109. The ar welliant 109. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid question is that amendment 109 be agreed to. derbyn gwelliant 109? Pawb o blaid i godi eu Those in favour, please raise your hands. dwylo. Pawb yn erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 109. amendment 109 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 109: O blaid 3, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 109: For 3, Abstain 2, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 109.
Amendment 109 not agreed.*

[397] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 136? to move amendment 136?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 136 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 136 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.

[398] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[399] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 136? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 136? Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb yn erbyn. Y rhai sy'n ymatal. Felly, mae 136 wedi methu. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 136.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 136 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 136 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 136 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 136: O blaid 4, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 136: For 4, Abstain 1, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
 Gruffydd, Llyr
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
 Morgan, Julie
 Price, Gwyn R.
 Rathbone, Jenny
 Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
 The following Member abstained:

Powell, William

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 136.
Amendment 136 not agreed.

[400] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 171?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 171.

[401] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Nid wyf i am wneud.

Llyr Gruffydd: I don't.

[402] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Nac ydych. Jenny Rathbone, a ydych chi am symud gwelliant 171?

Alun Ffred Jones: No, you don't. Jenny Rathbone, do you wish to move amendment 171?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 171 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 171 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[403] **Jenny Rathbone:** Ydw.

Jenny Rathbone: Yes.

[404] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 171. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad. [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Rydym yn symud i bleidlais ar welliant 171. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb yn erbyn. Y rhai sy'n ymatal. Mae 171 wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 171 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote on amendment 171. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Amendment 171 is agreed.

Gwelliant 171: O blaid 6, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 0.

Amendment 171: For 6, Abstain 4, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Jones, Alun Ffred
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 171.
Amendment 171 agreed.

Grŵp 10: Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol—Swyddogaethau (Gwelliannau 172, 137, 110, 173, 174, 175, 111, 36, 112, 113, 138, 85A, 85, 86, 87, 88, 89, 90A, 90, 140, 91, 176, 92, 93, 94, 95, 96, 97, 56, 57, 58, 59, 121 ac 84)

Group 10: Future Generations Commissioner—Functions (Amendments 172, 137, 110, 173, 174, 175, 111, 36, 112, 113, 138, 85A, 85, 86, 87, 88, 89, 90A, 90, 140, 91, 176, 92, 93, 94, 95, 96, 97, 56, 57, 58, 59, 121 and 84)

[405] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn i grŵp 10—swyddogaethau'r comisiynydd cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Mae llawer iawn o welliannau yma. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 172, yn enw Llyr Gruffydd. Galwaf ar Llyr i gynnig gwelliant 172, ac i siarad am y gwelliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp.

Alun Ffred Jones: We move to group 10—the functions of the future generations commissioner. There are a great many amendments here. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 172 in the name of Llyr Gruffydd. I call on Llyr to move amendment 172, and to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in the group.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 172 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 172 (Llyr Gruffydd)

[406] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. The amendments here seek to strengthen the role of the future generations commissioner, particularly 172, 173 and 174. Amendment 172 requires the commissioner to uphold and foster the implementation of the sustainable development principle, rather than simply promoting it, as is currently the case in the Bill. Amendment 173 would require the commissioner to act as a guardian of the ability of future generations to meet their own needs, rather than simply seek to safeguard their ability to do so. Amendment 174 requires the future generations commissioner to ensure that public bodies take greater account of the long-term impact of the things they do, rather than just encouraging them to do so.

[407] Amendment 175 relates to the commissioner's general duty in section 17 of the Bill. This important amendment brings the commissioner's duty in line with the wellbeing duty and ensures the commissioner is not inadvertently limited in his or her role. So, the duty to monitor and assess the extent to which wellbeing objectives set by public bodies are being met clearly includes the governance arrangements of public bodies, but also the exercise of their functions, which is clearly something that we've touched upon regularly in evidence that we've received. So, it's not just the way that public bodies are run, but it is about what—*[Inaudible.]*—and I think it brings the commissioner's duty in line with the wellbeing duty.

[408] Amendment 90A, if I can find it in my notes, strengthens the duty on a public body to follow or respond to the future generations commissioner's recommendations. Section 20, I

believe, as tabled would allow a public body to avoid compliance with recommendations if it satisfied on its own account that there is good reason not to follow those recommendations. This amendment requires them to explain the reasons for doing so and what alternative action they will be taking. So, it's an effort to make a public body more answerable and accountable if it doesn't follow the recommendations of the commissioner.

[409] Amendment 176 ensures that the commissioner consults with persons from the economic, social and environmental sectors during the reporting period of the future generations report. So, instead of just saying

[410] 'any other person the Commissioner considers appropriate',

[411] I want to add

[412] 'to ensure that economic, social and environmental interests are fully represented'

[413] so that we cover all the bases and so the pillars of sustainable development are all properly represented in that process. I'll probably pick up on other amendments in my closing remarks.

[414] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I call Antoinette Sandbach to speak.

[415] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Yes, I move amendments 138 and 85A. Amendment 138 expands the functions of the commissioner by providing the commissioner with the ability to require public bodies to provide information. It uses similar wording to section 19(4) and 19(5) for consistency. This was as a result of the evidence in front of the committee, which indicated that, really, in order to have teeth, the commissioner needed to be able to require information—[*Inaudible.*]—and this amendment inserts that into the Bill. The committee concluded that the ability to request information from public bodies and to initiate inquiries and investigations would be essential to the commissioner if he or she was really going to challenge those bodies on the decisions that they make. This is paragraph 138 of our report. This amendment will ensure that the commissioner can undertake their duties effectively and influence public bodies. Clearly, it's to provide such information as can lawfully be provided. That's why amendment 138 has been tabled.

[416] Amendment 85A amends the Welsh Government's amendment 85, which inserts a new section into the Bill relating to reviews by the commissioner. Our amendment will ensure that, where the commissioner has conducted a review into

[417] 'the extent to which a public body is safeguarding the ability of future generations to meet their needs',

[418] a report is laid before the National Assembly, and the purpose of this amendment is to increase the scrutiny as well as openness and transparency. It will obviously allow debate at that point if there is a report laid before the Assembly.

[419] Llyr Huws Gruffydd has tabled a number of amendments, and we'll be supporting some of them and not others, so our voting will indicate which ones we support, but there are some important safeguards, which have been tabled in amendments by Llyr Huws Gruffydd, which we will be supporting.

[420] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I call William Powell to speak.

[421] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I speak to amendment 110, which simply leaves out 'seek to'. In our view, that strengthens very much the safeguarding role. We don't see what the retention of 'seek to' achieves in that regard. On amendments 111, 112 and 113, as has already been addressed by Antoinette in her remarks, we think that powers of inquiry being added to the commissioner's role are very important indeed in the carrying out of those functions, drawing on people as appropriate to provide robust evidence and documentation. There should also be an obligation in our view on a public body to comply with the commissioner's request for information. The commissioner needs to have teeth, and that ties in with the independence that I referred to earlier. So, I would seek support for our amendments.

[422] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. A oes unrhyw Aelod arall eisiau siarad? Are there any other Members who wish to speak? Jenny Rathbone.

[423] **Jenny Rathbone:** The commissioner will need to be a heroic individual, not least because, at the moment, we don't have a clear purpose, aim and definition of the sustainable development principle, which the Minister had sought to introduce, but which the opposition at the moment is not going to go along with. But I don't think that the future generations commissioner can be responsible for upholding sustainable development, simply because they won't have the powers to do that. Obviously, they need to promote it and endeavour to ensure that public bodies carry out the letter and intent of the future generations Bill, but they cannot be upholding that principle simply because they don't have those executive powers.

11:15

[424] So, I very much like the wording in 173 to 'act as a guardian of' the ability of future generations to meet their needs, and I will be supporting that, but I don't think that we can impose on the future generations commissioner things that they simply won't be able to deliver.

[425] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ymateb, neu i call on the Minister to respond, or to speak. siarad.

[426] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. This is a heavily amended section of the Bill on both sides: Government and non-Government amendments. I seek for you to move the Government amendments, but also, in addition, I will be supporting amendments 173 and 176 in the name of Llyr Huws Gruffydd, and also 90A, also in his name. I believe these seek to strengthen the ability of the future generations commissioner and also give a more descriptive opportunity for the commissioner, in post, to do their job well. It's something I welcome—his commitment to strengthening the Bill, and I will be supportive of that.

[427] There are many other amendments in this tabling section that we will not be seeking to support at this point, as we've made very clear in our previous appearances in committee around the proposals, but we welcome the proposals added by Llyr that strengthen the role of the commissioner, we believe.

[428] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. I call on Llyr Galwaf ar Llyr Gruffydd i ymateb. Gruffydd to reply.

[429] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. I welcome the large number of amendments in this group, actually, because they're there for a purpose, and it is to strengthen the role. I thank the Minister for his support, as indicated to some of my amendments, because the commissioner must be, I believe, as strong as possible in order to be as effective as possible.

If the future generations commissioner does not uphold sustainable development, then I think we've got a serious problem here, and I would urge Members to support our amendment in that respect.

[430] I would make just a few comments on some other amendments: 137, 140 and 121. Again, they're adding the word 'current and', making it 'current and future generations'. I've touched on this previously, but, in this context, particularly, I believe that the interests of current generations are adequately represented by a large number of existing public bodies and appointments, and the focus of the future generations commissioner must be on the long-term interests of people in Wales, and that shouldn't be weakened or clouded by any amendments. So, I will not be supporting those particular amendments.

[431] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno symud i bleidlais ar welliant 172? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Llyr, do you wish to proceed to a vote on amendment 172?

[432] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Yes.

[433] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 172? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 172? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi dwylo. Yn erbyn. Rhywun yn ymatal? Bill. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 172. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 172 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 172 be agreed to. All those in favour, raise your hands. Those against. Anybody abstaining? Bill. Therefore, amendment 172 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 172: O blaid 2, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 172: For 2, Abstain 1, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Powell, William

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 172.
Amendment 172 not agreed.*

[434] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 137? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 137?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 137 (Antoinette Sandbach, gyda chefnogaeth William Powell).
Amendment 137 (Antoinette Sandbach, supported by William Powell) moved.*

[435] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[436] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 137. Unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 137 be agreed to. Any objection?

wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 137. O blaid—pawb i godi dwylo. Dau. Yn erbyn. Ymatal? Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 137.

[*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 137 be agreed to. In favour—everyone, raise your hands. Two. Those against. Abstaining? Therefore, amendment 137 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 137: O blaid 2, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 7.

Amendment 137: For 2, Abstain 1, Against 7.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Powell, William

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 137.
Amendment 137 not agreed.

[437] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 110?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 110?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 110 (William Powell).
Amendment 110 (William Powell) moved.

[438] **William Powell:** Yes, Chair.

[439] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynnir gwelliant 110, bydd gwelliant 173 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 110. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 110. Pawb o blaid i godi dwylo. Yn erbyn. Collwyd. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 110.

Alun Ffred Jones: If amendment 110 is agreed, amendment 173 will fall. The question is that amendment 110 be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 110 be agreed to. Everyone in favour to raise their hands. Those against. Lost. Amendment 110 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 110: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.

Amendment 110: For 3, Abstain 0, Against 7.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 110.

Amendment 110 not agreed.

[440] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 173?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 173?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 173 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 173 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[441] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[442] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 173. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais ar y gwelliant. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 173. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Yn ymatal. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 173.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 173 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote on amendment 173. The question is that amendment 173 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 173 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 173: O blaid 7, Ymatal 3, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 173: For 7, Abstain 3, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 173.
Amendment 173 agreed.*

[443] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 174?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 174?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 174 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 174 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[444] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[445] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 174. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 174. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 174.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 174 be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 174 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Therefore, amendment 174 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 174: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 174: For 3, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 174.
Amendment 174 not agreed.*

[446] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 175?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 175?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 175 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 175 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[447] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[448] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 175. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 175. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal. Defnyddiaf fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 175 be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 175 be agreed. All those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 175: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 175: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 175.
Amendment 175 not agreed.*

[449] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 111?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 111?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 111 (William Powell).
Amendment 111 (William Powell) moved.*

[450] **William Powell:** Yes. Chair.

[451] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 111. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 111. Y rheini o blaid, codwch eich dwylo. Yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal. Defnyddiaf fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 111.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 111 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 111 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 111 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 111: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 111: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 111.
Amendment 111 not agreed.*

[452] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 36 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 36 in the name of the Minister.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 36 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 36 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[453] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 136—sori, fe wna' i ddweud hwnna eto. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 36. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais ar welliant 36. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 36. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Ymatal Felly, derbyniwyd gwelliant 36.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 136 be agreed—sorry, I'll say that again. The question is that amendment 36 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote on amendment 36. The question is that amendment 36 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 36 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 36: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 36: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell

Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 36.
Amendment 36 agreed.*

[454] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 112?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 112?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 112 (William Powell).
Amendment 112 (William Powell) moved.*

[455] **William Powell:** Yes. Chair.

[456] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 112. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 112. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Pleidlais gyfartal. Defnyddiaf fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 112.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 112 be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] Move to a vote. The question is that amendment 112 be agreed. All those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 112 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 112: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 112: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 112.
Amendment 112 not agreed.*

[457] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 113?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 113?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 113 (William Powell).
Amendment 113 (William Powell) moved.*

[458] **William Powell:** Yes. Chair.

[459] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 113. Unrhyw

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 113 be agreed to. Any

wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 113. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Pleidlais gyfartal. Defnyddiaf fy mhleidlais yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 113.

objections? [*Objection.*] Move to a vote. The question is that amendment 113 be agreed. All those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Amendment 113 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 113: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 113: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 113.
Amendment 113 not agreed.*

[460] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 138? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 138?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 138 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 138 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[461] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[462] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 138. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 138. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Pleidlais gyfartal. Rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 138.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 138 be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 138 be agreed. All those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 138 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 138: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 138: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 138.

Amendment 138 not agreed.

[463] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cyn gwaredu gwelliant 85, byddwn yn ymdrin â'r gwelliant i'r gwelliant hwnnw. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Before disposing of amendment 85, we will deal with the amendment to that amendment.

[464] Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 85A? Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 85A?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 85A (Antoinette Sandbach).

Amendment 85A (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.

[465] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[466] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 85A. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 85A. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Pleidlais gyfartal. Defnyddiaf fy mhleidlais yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 85A. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 85A be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 85A be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 85A is not agreed.

Gwelliant 85A: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 85A: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 85A.

Amendment 85A not agreed.

[467] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 85 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 85 in the name of the Minister.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 85 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 85 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[468] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 85. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 85. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Ymatal. Felly, derbyniwyd gwelliant 85.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 85 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] I move to a vote. The question is that amendment 85 be agreed. All those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. Abstaining. Therefore, amendment 85 is agreed.

Gwelliant 85: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.

Amendment 85: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 85.
Amendment 85 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 86 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 86 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[469] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 86 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 86. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 86. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Felly, derbyniwyd gwelliant 86.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 86 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 86 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 86 be agreed to. All those in favour, please raise your hands. Against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 86 is agreed.

Gwelliant 86: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.

Amendment 86: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 86.
Amendment 86 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 87 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 87 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[470] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 87 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 87. Unrhyw

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 87 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 87 be agreed to. Any objection?

wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 87. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb yn erbyn. Ymatal. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 87.

[*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 87 be agreed to. All those in favour, please raise your hands. All those against. Abstentions. Amendment 87 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 87: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 87: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 87.
Amendment 87 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 88 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 88 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[471] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 88—rwy'n ei gynnig yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 88. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 88. Pawb o blaid i ddangos. Pawb yn erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 88.

Alun Ffred Jones: Amendment 88—I move it in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 88 be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 88 be agreed to. Those in favour to show. Those against. Those abstaining. Amendment 88 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 88: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 88: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 88.
Amendment 88 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 89 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 89 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[472] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 89 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 89. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 89. Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos—codi dwylo. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Pawb sy'n

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 89 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 89 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 89 be agreed to. Those in favour to show—raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Amendment

ymatal. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 89.

89 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 89: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 89: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 89.
Amendment 89 agreed.*

[473] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cyn gwaredu gwelliant 90, byddwn yn ymdrin â'r gwelliant i'r gwelliant hwnnw. Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 90A?

Alun Ffred Jones: Before disposing of amendment 90, we will deal with the amendment to that amendment. Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 90A?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 90A (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 90A (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[474] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[475] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 90A. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae 90A wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 90A be agreed to. Any objection? No. Therefore, amendment 90A is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 90A yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 90A agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 90 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 90 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[476] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 90 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 90 fel y'i diwygiwyd. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 90. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn? Yn ymatal? Mae gwelliant 90 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 90 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 90 as amended be agreed to. Is there any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 90 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Against? Abstaining? Amendment 90 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 90 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 90 as amended: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Watson, Joyce

Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 90 fel y'i diwygiwyd.
Amendment 90, as amended, agreed.*

[477] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 140? to move amendment 140?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 140 (Antoinette Sandbach, gyda chefnogaeth William Powell).
Amendment 140 (Antoinette Sandbach, supported by William Powell) moved.*

[478] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[479] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 140. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 140. Pawb o blaid i godi dwylo. Pawb yn erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 140.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 140 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 140 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 140 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 140: O blaid 2, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 140: For 2, Abstain 1, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Powell, William

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 140.
Amendment 140 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 91 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 91 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[480] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 91 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 91. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 91. Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 91.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 91 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 91 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 91 be agreed to. All those in favour, please show. All those against. All those abstaining. Amendment 91 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 91: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 91: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 91.
Amendment 91 agreed.*

[481] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 176?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 176?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 176 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 176 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[482] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes.

[483] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 176. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Felly, mae gwelliant 176 wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 176 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No objections. Therefore, amendment 176 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 176 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 176 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 92 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 92 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[484] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 92 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 92. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 92. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Mae gwelliant 92 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 92 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 92 be agreed to. Any objection? [Objection.] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 92 be agreed to. All those in favour, please raise your hands. All those against. All those abstaining. Amendment 92 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 92: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 92: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 92.
Amendment 92 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 93 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 93 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[485] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n symud ymlaen. Cynigiaf welliant 93 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 93. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 93. Pawb o blaid i ddangos. Pawb yn erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal.

Alun Ffred Jones: Moving on, I move amendment 93 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 93 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 93 be agreed to. Those in favour to show. Those against. Those abstaining.

*Gwelliant 93: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 93: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 93.
Amendment 93 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 94 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 94 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[486] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 94 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 94. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 94. Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos a chodi dwylo. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 94 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 94 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 94 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 94 be agreed to. Those in favour, please show by raising your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Amendment 94 is agreed in the name of the Minister.

*Gwelliant 94: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 94: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 94.
Amendment 94 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 95 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 95 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[487] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 95 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 95. Unrhyw

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 95 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 95 be agreed to. Any objection?

wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 95. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 95? Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 95.

[*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 95 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 95 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 95 is agreed.

11:30

*Gwelliant 95: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 95: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 95.
Amendment 95 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 96 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 96 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[488] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 96 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 96? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 96 yn enw'r Gweinidog? Pawb o blaid i ddangos. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 96.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 96 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 96 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 96 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 96 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 96: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 96: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 96.
Amendment 96 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 97 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 97 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[489] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 97 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 97 in the name of the Minister. The question is that

ddyliid derbyn gwelliant 97? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddyliid derbyn gwelliant 97? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 97.

amendment 97 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 97 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 97 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 97: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 97: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 97.
Amendment 97 agreed.*

**Grŵp 11: Panel Cyngori (Gwelliannau 114, 74, 141, 115, 143, 144 a 116)
Group 11: Advisory Panel (Amendments 114, 74, 141, 115, 143, 144 and 116)**

[490] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym ni'n symud ymlaen i'r grŵp nesaf, grŵp 11, sy'n ymwneud â'r panel cyngori. Prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 114 yn enw William Powell. Galwaf ar William i gynnig gwelliant 114 ac i siarad am ei welliant ac am y gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp.

Alun Ffred Jones: We move on to the next group, group 11, which relates to the advisory panel. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 114 in the name of William Powell. I call on William to move amendment 114 and to speak to his amendment and to the other amendments in the group.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 114 (William Powell).
Amendment 114 (William Powell) moved.*

[491] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I speak to amendments 114, 115 and 116 in this section. It was a matter that the committee agreed upon at Stage 1 that it's very important indeed that there should be cross-party and stakeholder involvement in the whole process for appointing the future generations commissioner, and that is why we also think that the nomination should be of the National Assembly rather than Welsh Ministers, and that is the intent of amendment 114. Amendment 115: in our view, the membership of that advisory panel has to be based on the skills and experience that they have in relation to sustainable development and the wellbeing goals, when they're finally enshrined in law, rather than them being commissioners appointed by Welsh Government. We don't want to be overly prescriptive as to who makes up that advisory panel, but they must be there on the basis of the skills that they bring. Finally, in terms of amendment 116, the dismissal of any members of that panel must be a decision that's done in full consultation with the future generations commissioner, in our view. I'd seek your support for those amendments.

[492] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar Antoinette Sandbach.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you very much. I call on Antoinette Sandbach.

[493] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Yes, in relation to amendment 141 and amendments 143 and 144, these again are to strengthen the role of the commissioner. Amendment 141 relates to

members of the advisory panel, and it replaces

[494] ‘members...are...other person as the Welsh Ministers may appoint’

[495] with

[496] ‘other person as the National Assembly for Wales may, on the recommendation of the Commissioner’

[497] appoint. The purpose of this is to ensure that the commissioner has a real say on who is on their board. The amendment increases transparency and scrutiny because it allows the Assembly, in effect, to ratify the decisions of the proposed commissioner.

[498] In relation to amendment 143, this again relates to members appointed to the advisory panel. Again, it provides for the National Assembly to determine the period in which the appointed member holds office, rather than Welsh Ministers. I do think this is important, where the commissioner is going to have a role of scrutiny, particularly over Government, and other public bodies, that there is that oversight, and that they can’t, in effect, be dismissed at will by a Welsh Minister. Without having an amendment, that is the risk.

[499] Then there is a substantial body of other amendments that are linked with amendment 144, so I will speak to that here, but also in the later grouping. Those amendments transfer responsibility from Welsh Ministers to the commissioner. Many stakeholders commented that the duties and functions of the commissioner should be strengthened, which is particularly seen at paragraph 127 of our report: stakeholders

[500] ‘from environmental groups stressed the importance of strengthening the powers of the Commissioner to ensure that public bodies be under a duty to follow the Commissioner’s recommendations.’

[501] So, that will come into play with the later amendments that I propose, which I think are in another group—but 114 relates to that side, just to flag that up at this stage.

[502] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. A oes Aelodau eraill sy’n dymuno siarad? Are there any other Members who wish to speak? No. So, I call on the Minister to speak. Na. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog, felly.

[503] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. We gave this very careful consideration following the report of this committee and made one Government amendment to that—amendment 74, which is significant. I’m also minded to support the non-Government amendment of William Powell, amendment 116. I think it’s a procedural issue, which I also agree with him: it would be rather unfortunate for members leaving and not telling anybody they’re leaving in any sort of guise, and therefore it would be a purpose of the legislation and I would be certainly supportive of that.

[504] Can I also add that the amendment will allow the Welsh Ministers to appoint a senior member from the trade union sector to this panel to ensure balance and cross-representation on the panel? The Welsh Ministers will also be able to appoint a business representative, too. I would ask you to move the amendment in my name, and also to support the amendment in William Powell’s name, amendment 116, and to reject the others.

[505] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Galwaf ar **Alun Ffred Jones:** I call on William Powell William Powell i ymateb i’r ddadl. to reply to the debate.

[506] **William Powell:** Thank you very much, Chair, and I'd like to thank the Minister for his shifting in our direction in terms of amendment 116. I think that, hopefully, we can all agree that that is a useful clarification in terms of the unfortunate circumstances around any potential dismissal of a panel member at a future time. However, I would reiterate that the amendments 114 and, indeed, 115, but particularly 114, relate to recommendations that this committee made at an earlier stage, and I think did so with good reason. The point that Antoinette Sandbach made earlier with regard to the key role of the relationship between the future generations commissioner and the panel that would serve her or him in the carrying out of that role is important, and I think, again, it does come back to the issue of the independence of that person. And I believe that our amendments do bring greater strength in that regard and I would seek your support.

[507] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. William, do you wish to proceed to a vote on amendment 114?

[508] **William Powell:** Yes. Move.

[509] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynnir 114, bydd gwelliannau 74 a 141 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 114? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 114? Y rheiny o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 114.

Alun Ffred Jones: If amendment 114 is agreed, amendments 74 and 141 will fall. The question is that amendment 114 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] So, we'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 114 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 114 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 114: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 114: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 114.
Amendment 114 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 74 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 74 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[510] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 74 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 74? Unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 74 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 74 be agreed. Does any Member

wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 74? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 74.

object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 74 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 74 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 74: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 74: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Gruffydd, Llyr
George, Russell
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 74.
Amendment 74 agreed.*

[511] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 141?

Alun Ffred Jones: Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 141?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 141 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 141 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[512] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[513] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 141? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 141? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi'u dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly defnyddiaf fy mhleidlais fwrw'n negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Rhaid imi ddarllen Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. [*Chwerthin.*] Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 141.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 141 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll therefore move to a vote. The question is that amendment 141 agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I'll use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. I will have to read Standing Order 6.20 sometime. [*Laughter.*] Amendment 141 was not agreed.

*Gwelliant 141: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 141: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 141.
Amendment 141 not agreed.*

[514] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 115?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 115?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 115 (William Powell).
Amendment 115 (William Powell) moved.*

[515] **William Powell:** Move.

[516] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 115. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 115. Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 115.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 115 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 115 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Therefore, amendment 115 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 115: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 115: For 3, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 115.
Amendment 115 not agreed.*

[517] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 143?

Alun Ffred Jones: Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 143?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 143 (Antoinette Sandbach, gyda chefnogaeth William Powell).
Amendment 143 (Antoinette Sandbach, supported by William Powell) moved.*

[518] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[519] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 143? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 143? Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 143.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 143 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 143 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 143 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 143: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 143: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 143.
Amendment 143 not agreed.*

[520] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 144? to move amendment 144?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 144 (Antoinette Sandbach, gyda chefnogaeth William Powell).
Amendment 144 (Antoinette Sandbach, supported by William Powell) moved.*

[521] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[522] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 144? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 144? Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos hynny. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 144.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 144 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 144 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 144 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 144: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 144: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 144.
Amendment 144 not agreed.*

[523] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 116? **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 116?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 116 (William Powell, gyda chefnogaeth Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 116 (William Powell, supported by Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[524] **William Powell:** Yes, Chair.

[525] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 116 be agreed to. Does any Member object? Therefore, amendment 116 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 116 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 116 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

Grŵp 12: Byrddau Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus—Cyfranogiad a Chraffu (Gwelliannau 177, 1, 178, 179, 145, 180, 37, 2, 3, 426, 27, 43, 54, 25 a 45)
Group 12: Public Services Boards—Participation and Scrutiny (Amendments 177, 1, 178, 179, 145, 180, 37, 2, 3, 426, 27, 43, 54, 25 and 45)

[526] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym yn symud ymlaen felly at grŵp 12, sy'n ymwneud â threfniadau cyfranogi. *[Torri ar draws.]* Sori? Na, rwyf am wneud y bloc yma ac wedyn fe awn i egwyl. Rwy'n mynd i symud i egwyl ar ôl y bloc yma. Grŵp 12. Rydych chi wedi bod yn dda iawn hyd yn hyn. *[Torri ar draws.]* Beth, y bloc yma? *[Torri ar draws.]*

Alun Ffred Jones: We move now to group 12 relating to participation and scrutiny. *[Interruption.]* Sorry? No, I do want to complete this block and then we'll go to a break. I am going to move to a break after this block. Group 12. You've been very good up until now. *[Interruption.]* What, this block? *[Interruption.]*

[527] Minister, do you want to change officials for this group?

[528] **Carl Sargeant:** I'm content at this point. If you want to move this block, we will manage, I think.

[529] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay.

[530] Reit, Gadeirydd, y prif welliant—. Fi yw'r Cadeirydd. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 177 yn enw Llyr Gruffydd. Galwaf ar Llyr i gynnig gwelliant 177 a siarad am ei welliant.

Okay, Chair, the lead amendment—. I'm the Chair. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 177 in the name of Llyr Gruffudd. I call on Llyr to move amendment 177 and to speak to his amendment.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 177 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 177 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[531] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Amendment 177 is pretty straightforward. It asks that a public services board would have to invite bodies in the plural, as opposed to a body representing voluntary organisations in the area to participate in the activity of the board. It needs to be read in association with our amendment, or my amendment, 178, which ensures that public services boards invite voluntary bodies representing economic, social and environmental interests in the area to participate in the activity of the board. So, the intention here is to ensure a breadth of participation from representatives of each of the pillars.

[532] Amendment 179 adds to the list a person or bodies representing natural environment or nature conservation interests in a local authority area on to a public services board. I feel this is particularly needed to counterbalance the current bias towards social representation that

we have in the Bill as it stands. And, certainly, it would therefore obviously strengthen the environmental voice and introduce a better balance, in my view.

[533] Amendment 180 also broadens out who each board may invite to participate to include any other representatives from economic, environmental and social interests. Again, as I'm sure you're picking up, it's aimed at strengthening the breadth and the balance of each pillar within the public services boards.

[534] I'll be opposing amendment 145, because my understanding is that, if it is agreed, my amendment 180 will fall.

[535] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Diolch yn fawr. Antoinette Sandbach. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay. Thank you. Antoinette Sandbach.

[536] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Well, my amendment is simple, and it effectively omits who exercises functions of a public nature. Again, as I spoke earlier, it transfers the responsibility from Welsh Ministers to the commissioner, and particularly—. Sorry, I don't think we've got amendment 146 in this group, have we?

[537] **Alun Ffred Jones:** It doesn't appear so, no.

[538] **Antoinette Sandbach:** No, it's later. So, mine's a simple amendment in 145, and it basically is to ensure that persons are able to participate in the activity of a public services board, regardless of whether or not they exercise functions of a public nature, because I think otherwise the pool is too restrictive.

11:45

[539] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Diolch yn fawr. William Powell. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay. Thank you very much. William Powell.

[540] **William Powell:** Sorry, Chair. I don't know—

[541] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I think that you're supporting.

[542] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Do you have a—?

[543] **William Powell:** Do you wish me to speak?

[544] **Alun Ffred Jones:** You're supporting Antoinette. So, you don't—

[545] **William Powell:** I absolutely support Antoinette in that proposal, but no other amendments.

[546] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you.

[547] Aelodau eraill? Jenny Rathbone. Any other Members? Jenny Rathbone.

[548] **Jenny Rathbone:** I think amendments 177 and 145 are just too prescriptive. We have to remember that we are talking about legislating for all public bodies. Some are bigger than others. Some will have relatively small matters that they wish to receive information about. I think it's fine to insist that they must have a voice of voluntary organisations, but to put in the word 'bodies' means that you could be faced with endless numbers of bodies that have to be invited to participate in something that was only relevant to one of them. Therefore, it's perfectly possible to be more inclusive than just one voluntary body, but it doesn't actually

require you to call in every type of public body on a matter that may only affect one of them.

[549] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Fine. Thank you very much. I call on the Minister to speak.

[550] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you. Can I start by thanking Llyr, and understanding that his intention here is to broaden the scope of the public service boards' participation? The Bill, as currently drafted, is not prohibitive to anybody in that process, Chair. It is clear to us, but I also recognise that if it's not clear to everyone, then maybe we need to rethink at the next stage in terms of being more specific. I won't be able to support Llyr's amendments today, and would ask him to consider not moving them on the basis that I will bring back a different form of words at Stage 3. Probably, a viable alternative may be for a PSB duty to invite such bodies representing voluntary organisations in an area as the board considers appropriate. It isn't prohibitive now, but we might be able to tidy that up, if it gives confidence to Members at Stage 3, as in the interpretation that was made by Llyr today. We will not be seeking to support amendment 145 in the name of Antoinette Sandbach.

[551] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch. Llyr Gruffydd. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Llyr Gruffydd.

[552] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. I'm not sure that our amendment 177 is actually prescriptive. In fact, limiting it to one body, I think, is more prescriptive than allowing more than one body to be a part. As regards an endless list of bodies being involved, well, you know, it's about participation, co-production and inclusivity, and I think that there's nothing wrong with that within reason. I understand the point that you make. If the Minister is indicating that he is willing to try to address this in Stage 3, then I would be happy not to move amendments 177 and 178. Am I to understand that the Minister's extending that offer to amendment 179 as well, in relation to a specific natural environment or nature conservation body?

[553] **Alun Ffred Jones:** You're pushing your luck.

[554] **Carl Sargeant:** If I may, Chair, the issue here is that we don't see the current drafting as prohibitive at all. I think that it's just clarity that's required here. I think that the drafting that we could bring back will encompass all of the issues that the Member is seeking. As I've said, we don't think that it's prohibitive now, but we will broaden that out, and I will seek engagement with the Member to see if we can come to a compromise of wording that is more appropriate to what he seeks.

[555] **Llyr Gruffydd:** If that is the case, I will not be moving amendments 177, 178, 179 or 180. Thank you.

[556] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae gwelliant 177 wedi'i symud yn barod, wrth gwrs, ar y dechrau. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 177 has already been moved, of course, at the beginning.

[557] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ocê. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Oh, okay.

[558] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, mae angen iti ei dynnu yn ôl. **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, you do need to withdraw it.

[559] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Mi dynnaf y gwelliant yn ôl, felly. Nawr neu— **Llyr Gruffydd:** I will withdraw it, then. Now or—

[560] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any objection to the

wrthwynebiad i dynnu gwelliant 177 yn ôl? withdrawal of amendment 177?

[561] **Carl Sargeant:** Chair, if I may, removing that amendment doesn't remove the proposal to continue with our amendments, does it, as Government amendments? It doesn't prohibit that.

[562] **Alun Ffred Jones:** No.

[563] Felly, dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae So, there is no objection. Amendment 177 has gwelliant 177 wedi'i dynnu'n ôl, felly. therefore been withdrawn.

Tynnwyd gwelliant 177 yn ôl gyda chaniatâd y pwyllgor.
Amendment 177 withdrawn by leave of the committee.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 1 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 1 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[564] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 1 in 1 yn enw'r Gweinidog. the name of the Minister.

[565] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn The question is that amendment 1 be agreed gwelliant 1? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais ar We'll move to a vote on amendment 1. The welliant 1. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn question is that amendment 1 be agreed to. gwelliant 1? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi dwylo. Those in favour please raise your hands. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sydd yn ymatal. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, Mae gwelliant 1 wedi'i dderbyn. amendment 1 is agreed.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 1: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 1.
Amendment 1 agreed.

[566] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, rydych **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, you have withdrawn wedi tynnu gwelliant 178 yn ôl. amendment 178.

[567] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Do. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Yes.

Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 178.
Amendment 178 not moved.

[568] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A gwelliant 179. **Alun Ffred Jones:** And amendment 179.

[569] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Do. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Yes.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 179.
Amendment 179 not moved.*

[570] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 145?

Alun Ffred Jones: Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 145?

[571] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 145 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 145 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[572] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynnir gwelliant 145 bydd gwelliant 180, sydd wedi cael ei dynnu'n ôl, yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 145? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 145? Os ydych o blaid, dangoswch eich dwylo. Antoinette, a ydych o blaid 145? Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Mae'n bleidlais gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog—rydych yn gyfarwydd iawn â hi erbyn hyn—6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 145.

Alun Ffred Jones: If amendment 145 is agreed, amendment 180, which has been withdrawn, falls. The question is that amendment 145 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 145 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Antoinette, are you in favour of 145? Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order—you're very familiar with it by now—6.20. Therefore, amendment 145 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 145: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 145: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 145
Amendment 145 not agreed.*

[573] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae gwelliant 180 wedi'i dynnu yn ôl.

Alun Ffred Jones: Amendment 180 has been withdrawn.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 180.
Amendment 180 not moved.*

[574] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 37 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 37 in the name of the Minister.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 37 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 37 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[575] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 37? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Symudwn i bleidlais—[*Torri ar draws.*] The question is that amendment 37 be agreed to. Does any Member object? We'll move to a vote—[*Interruption.*]

[576] Okay. There are no objections.

[577] Felly, mae gwelliant 37 wedi'i dderbyn. Therefore, amendment 37 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 37 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 37 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

[578] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 2 yn enw'r Gweinidog yw'r un nesaf. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 2 in the name of the Minister is next.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 2 (Carl Sargeant)
Amendment 2 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[579] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 2? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 2? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sydd yn ymatal. Mae gwelliant 2 wedi'i basio. The question is that amendment 2 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 2 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 2 is agreed.

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 2: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 2.
Amendment 2 agreed.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 3 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 3 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[580] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 3 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 3 in the name of the Minister.

[581] Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 3. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 3. Pawb sydd o blaid i godi dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sydd yn ymatal. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 3. The question is that amendment 3 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 3 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 3 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 3: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 3.
Amendment 3 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 4 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 4 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[582] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 4 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 4 in the name of the Minister.

[583] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 4? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 4? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sydd yn ymatal. Mae gwelliant 4 wedi'i gytuno.

The question is that amendment 4 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 4 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 4 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 4: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 4
Amendment 4 agreed.*

[584] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cyn gwaredu gwelliant 38, byddwn yn ymdrin â'r gwelliannau i'r gwelliant hwnnw. Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 38A?

Alun Ffred Jones: Before disposing of amendment 38, we will deal with the amendments to that amendment. Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 38A?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 38A (Llyr Gruffydd)
Amendment 38A (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[585] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

Llyr Gruffydd: Yes.

[586] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 38A? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*]

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 38A be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a

Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 38A. Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos hynny. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Gan ei bod yn bleidlais gyfartal, defnyddiaf bleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbynnir y gwelliant.

vote. The question is that amendment 38A be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 38A: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 38A: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 38A.
Amendment 38A not agreed.*

[587] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 38B?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 38B?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 38B (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 38B (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[588] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Symud.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[589] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 38B? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 38B? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sydd yn ymatal. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw sydd gen i yn mynd yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbynnir y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 38B be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 38B be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 38B: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 38B: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 38B
Amendment 38B not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 38 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 38 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[590] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 38 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 38 in the name of the Minister.

[591] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 38? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 38? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sydd yn ymatal. Mae gwelliant 38 wedi ei dderbyn.

The question is that amendment 38 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [Objection.] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 38 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 38 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 38: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 38: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 38.
Amendment 38 agreed.*

[592] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ar y pwynt yna, rwy'n mynd i alw'r sesiwn yma i ben ac fe fyddwn ni'n ailymgynnull am 12:30.

Alun Ffred Jones: At that point, I am going to call this session to an end and we will reconvene at 12:30.

Is that okay? Diolch yn fawr iawn. Thank you.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 11:56 a 12:33.
The meeting adjourned between 11:56 and 12:33.*

[593] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Prynawn da. Rydym ni'n parhau â'n trafodaethau ynglŷn â Bil Llesiant Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol (Cymru).

Alun Ffred Jones: Good afternoon. We continue with our consideration of the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill.

Grŵp 13: Byrddau Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus—Aseidiadau Llesiant Lleol (Gwelliannau 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 181 a 182)
Group 13: Public Service Boards—Local Wellbeing Assessments (Amendments 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 181 and 182)

[594] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Grŵp 13 ydy'r grŵp nesaf o welliannau, sy'n ymwneud â byrddau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ac aseidiadau llesiant lleol. Prif welliant y grŵp yw gwelliant 5, yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: Group 13 is the next group of amendments, in relation to public service boards and local wellbeing assessments. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 5, in the name of the Minister.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 5 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 5 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[595] Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 5 a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad am ei welliant ac am y gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp hwn. Diolch.

I move amendment 5 and call on the Minister to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in this group. Thank you.

[596] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I'm tabling amendments 5, 6, 7, 8 and 9 in this group, and seek support from the committee. I'm tabling these to clarify that the context of assessment of local wellbeing communities refers to a geographical community. The effect of amendment 7 is that the analysis of wellbeing provided for in section 35 must include an analysis of the state of wellbeing of the people of that area. In conjunction with amendment 9, that analysis of the state of wellbeing may include analyses particular categories of persons, including persons who are vulnerable or otherwise disadvantaged. 'Carers' are those who receive care from carers, children, or those who have shared protected characteristics under the equality Act of 2010. We have sought to enhance this particular section of the Bill and are seeking support from the committee.

[597] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar Llyr Gruffydd i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you very much. I call Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[598] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. Our amendment 181 adds to the list of what public service boards should take into account when they prepare their local wellbeing assessments. We ask that that list include UK climate change risk assessment and the climate change strategy for Wales and the sectoral adaptation plans. Now, this would require, therefore, public service boards to take account of climate change issues, alongside the current list of social concerns, and I believe it would strengthen the environmental focus of the public service boards.

[599] Amendment 182 seeks to further add to that very same list. We would like to add, as well, that it include the most recent assessment carried out by the natural resources body for Wales of the state of natural resources in the local authority area, or the best available evidence if such an assessment is yet to be carried out. Now, this would obviously help raise the local environmental knowledge of a public services board in preparing its local wellbeing plan, and, again, it would help counter the current bias, I feel, that exists towards social bodies, and introduce more balance. And, if the Government is intent on creating lists in the Bill, then it is important to me that the environmental pillar, particularly of sustainable development, is there, too.

[600] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Diolch yn fawr. A oes unrhyw Aelod arall eisiau siarad?

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you very much. Are there any other Members who wish to speak?

[601] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Yes, please.

[602] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette.

[603] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I'd like to support what Llyr Huws Gruffydd has said, and we will be supporting his amendments, because I do think it's important that the appropriate balance is struck.

[604] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I call on the Minister to reply to the debate.

[605] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, and I thank Llyr for his explanation around his amendments. We will not be seeking to support them as drafted, because the climate change strategy for Wales and sectoral adaptation plans are not statutory reviews/assessments of a kind that section 36 relates to. However, I do agree that the UK climate risk assessment could usefully be added to the list of reviews and assessments that must be taken into account when preparing an assessment of the wellbeing, and will seriously consider the appropriateness of an amendment at Stage 3 of that proposal to do that.

[606] In regard to amendment 182, until such an assessment of the state of natural resources exists in law, we cannot refer to it, so I do intend to introduce area statements in the forthcoming environment Bill, and, at that appropriate point, we will then take into account the listing as soon as possible. I'd ask the Chair to move my amendments.

[607] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much.

[608] Rwyf am gynnig, felly, welliant 5. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 5? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Felly, mae gwelliant 5 wedi'i dderbyn. Therefore, I propose amendment 5. The question is that amendment 5 be agreed to. Does any Member object? There is no objection, therefore amendment 5 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 5 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 5 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 6 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 6 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[609] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 6 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 6? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Mae gwelliant 6 wedi'i dderbyn. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 6 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 6 be agreed to. Does any Member object? Therefore amendment 6 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 6 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 6 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 7 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 7 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[610] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 7 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 7? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Mae gwelliant 7 wedi'i dderbyn, felly. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 7 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 7 be agreed to. Does any Member object? Amendment 7 is agreed, therefore.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 7 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 7 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 8 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 8 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[611] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 8 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 8? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad, felly mae gwelliant 8 wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 8 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 8 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No objection, therefore amendment 8 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 8 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 8 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 9 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 9 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[612] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 9 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 9? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes, felly mae gwelliant 9 wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 9 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 9 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No, therefore amendment 9 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 9 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 9 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

[613] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 181?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 181?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 181 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 181 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[614] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: I move.

[615] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 181? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, rydym ni'n symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 181? Pawb o blaid i ddangos. Pawb yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal; rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 181.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 181 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] So, we move to a vote. The question is that amendment 181 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I'll use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 181 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 181: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 181: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
 Gruffydd, Llyr
 Jones, Alun Ffred

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
 Morgan, Julie
 Price, Gwyn R.

Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 181.
Amendment 181 not agreed.*

[616] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 182?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 182?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 182 (Llyr Huws Gruffydd).
Amendment 182 (Llyr Huws Gruffydd) moved.*

[617] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[618] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 182? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 182. Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Gan fod y bleidlais yn gyfartal, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 182.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 182 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 182 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 182 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 182: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 182: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 182.
Amendment 182 not agreed.*

Grŵp 14: Byrddau Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus—Cynlluniau Llesiant Lleol (Gwelliannau 39, 40, 10, 41, 11, 12, 42, 13, 14, 15, 44, 45, 46, 47, 16, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 71 a 72)

Group 14: Public Services Boards—Local Wellbeing Plans (Amendments 39, 40, 10, 41, 11, 12, 42, 13, 14, 15, 44, 45, 46, 47, 16, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 71 and 72)

[619] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn ymlaen at grŵp 14, byrddau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus—cynlluniau llesiant lleol. Y prif

Alun Ffred Jones: We move on to group 14, public service boards—local wellbeing plans. The lead amendment in this group is

welliant yw gwelliant 39 yn enw'r amendment 39 in the name of the Minister.
Gweinidog.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 39 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 39 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[620] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 39 a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad am ei welliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 39 and I call on the Minister to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in the group.

[621] **Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Chair for the opportunity to speak to the amendments, and wish to move all the amendments in this group. However, in the marshalled list appropriate to later, I will be raising amendment 43, which I will not be seeking to move in the marshalled list under this next voting section. This group contains a number of important amendments related to the way public services boards carry out their duties in the Bill. I'm tabling these amendments as a package, because they are consequential on the removal from the Bill of the local aim and the insertion of the wellbeing duty, as in amendment 38. I formally move.

[622] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Diolch yn fawr. A oes Aelodau eraill yn dymuno siarad? Yn amlwg nid ydych yn mynd i ymateb gan nad oes neb wedi dweud dim byd. Felly, Weinidog, a ydych yn dymuno symud i bleidlais ar welliant 39? **Alun Ffred Jones:** All right. Thank you very much. Does any other Member wish to speak? Clearly, you are not going to respond as no-one has said anything. Therefore, Minister, do you wish to move to a vote on amendment 39?

[623] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, formally.

[624] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 39? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 39 wedi ei basio. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 39 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 39 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 39 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 39 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 40 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 40 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[625] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 40 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 40? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 40 wedi ei dderbyn. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 40 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 40 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 40 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 40 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 40 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 10 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 10 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[626] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 10 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 10? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 10 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 10 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No, there is not. Therefore,

10 wedi ei dderbyn.

amendment 10 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 10 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 10 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 41 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 41 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[627] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 41 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 41? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 41 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 41 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 41 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 41 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 41 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 41 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 11 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 11 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[628] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 11 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 11? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 11 wedi ei basio.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 11 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 11 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 11 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 11 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 11 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 12 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 12 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[629] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 12 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 12? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 12 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 12 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 12 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 12 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 12 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 12 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 42 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 42 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[630] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 42 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 42? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 42 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 42 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 42 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 42 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 42 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 42 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 13 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 13 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[631] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 13 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 13? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 13 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 13 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 13 be agreed. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 13 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 13 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.

Amendment 13 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 14 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 14 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[632] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 14 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 14? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 14 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 14 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 14 be agreed. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 14 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 14 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.

Amendment 14 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 15 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 15 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[633] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 15 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 15? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 15 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 15 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 15 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 15 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 15 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.

Amendment 15 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

[634] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 43 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 43 in the name of the Minister.

[635] **Carl Sargeant:** I'm not seeking to move that amendment, Chair. On the basis of the significant amendments that have been voted against by the opposition—26 the new wellbeing duty, 27 the new wellbeing goals, and 30 the new sustainable development principle—these are consequential amendments that we consider not necessary in this process. While they've been voted against, we are not seeking to move this at this time.

Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 43 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 43 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.

[636] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, nid yw 43 wedi cael ei symud.

Alun Ffred Jones: Therefore, 43 hasn't been moved.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 44 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 44 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[637] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 44 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 44? A oes unrhyw

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 44 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 44 be agreed to. Does any

wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 44 wedi ei dderbyn.

Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 44 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 44 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 44 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 45 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 45 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[638] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 45 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 45? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 45 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 45 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 45 be agreed. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 45 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 45 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 45 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 46 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 46 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[639] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 46 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 46? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 46 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 46 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 46 be agreed. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 46 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 46 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 46 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 47 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 47 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[640] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 47 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 47? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 47 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 47 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 47 be agreed. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 47 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 47 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 47 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

12:45

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 16 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 16 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[641] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 16 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 16? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 16 wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 16 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 16 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 16 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 16 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 16 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 48 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 48 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[642] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 48 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 48? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, mae gwelliant 48 wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 48 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 48 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 48 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 48 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 48 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 49 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 49 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[643] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 49 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 49? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Mae gwelliant 49 wedi'i dderbyn, felly.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 49 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 49 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 49 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 49 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 49 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 50 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 50 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[644] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 50 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 50? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, derbyniwyd gwelliant 50.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 50 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 50 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 50 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 50 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 50 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 51 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 51 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[645] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 51 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 51? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, derbyniwyd gwelliant 51.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 51 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 51 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 51 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 51 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 51 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 52 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 52 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[646] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 52 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 52? Unrhyw

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 52 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 52 be agreed to. Does any

wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Felly, derbyniwyd Member object? No. Therefore, amendment
gwelliant 52. 52 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 52 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 52 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

Grŵp 15: Byrddau Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus—amrywiol (Gwelliannau 75, 146, 147, 76, 77, 148, 149, 78, 150, 151, 152, 153, 154, 117, 155, 17, 156, 83, 21)
Group 15: Public Services Boards—miscellaneous (Amendments 75, 146, 147, 76, 77, 148, 149, 78, 150, 151, 152, 153, 154, 117, 155, 17, 156, 83, 21)

[647] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y grŵp nesaf yw **Alun Ffred Jones:** The next group is group 15: byrddau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac 15 relating to public service boards, and this mae hwn yn ymwneud â darpariaethau relates to miscellaneous provisions relating to amrywiol sy'n ymwneud â'r byrddau hynny. public services boards. The lead amendment Prif welliant y grŵp ydy gwelliant 75 yn in the group is amendment 75 in the name of enw'r Gweinidog. the Minister.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 75 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 75 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[648] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwyf yn cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 75 gwelliant 75 a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad and I call on the Minister to speak to his am ei welliant ac am y gwelliannau eraill yn amendment and the other amendments in the y grŵp. Weinidog. group. Minister.

[649] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I am seeking support for 75 and consequential amendments in this group as listed. Amendment 75 along with the other amendments is consequential on the removal from the Bill of the 'local aim' and the insertion of the wellbeing duty of PSBs as now set in the section inserted by amendment 38, which we agreed. My amendment 17 simply requires Welsh Ministers in issuing guidance to public services boards in relation to function under part 4 of the Bill, rather than having a power to do so. This is in response to the recommendation as listed in the committee report, and we've addressed this process. Amendment 83 clarifies that only the PSB may set out, review or revise its local objectives and those actions cannot be delegated to a sub-group of the PSB. Again, I'm sure this is something that the committee would support.

[650] I urge the rejection of amendments listed by Antoinette Sandbach: 146,147,148, 149, 150 and 151. They confer vastly increased powers on the commissioner, far outside the role envisaged for the commissioner in the first place to direct PSBs to merge or collaborate. This is somewhat surprising given the Member's comments in earlier sessions and now that she is seeking to enhance the power of the commissioner, where before it was not quite the case. I also cannot accept her amendments 152, 153, 154 and 155 as a package because I don't believe it is appropriate for the commissioner to make the regulations as I believe there is a democratic process here that could potentially be undermined. I seek to move my amendments.

[651] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Dyna ni. Diolch **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right. Thank you very yn fawr, Weinidog. Galwaf ar Antoinette much, Minister. I call on Antoinette Sandbach i siarad. Sandbach to speak.

[652] **Antoinette Sandbach:** These amendments have been tabled and I move amendments 146, 147, 148, 149, 150, 151, 152, 153, 154, 155 and 156. They have been tabled to increase the powers of the commissioner, and I note that the Minister says that it vastly increases the powers of the commissioner, but, of course, then the legislation vastly increases the powers of

Welsh Ministers. That's what you're seeking support for, namely, in effect for those powers to be in your name rather than in the commissioner's name, and I think that is of concern. I hear what you say about 152—was it 152, 153 and 154 in terms of the regulations that you had objections to? I move them at this stage but I'll consider whether or not I'll retable those amendments in the future. I will seek to move them at this stage, but maybe there's a discussion that we could have in respect of those amendments if you feel that there is an alternative approach. But, again, the commissioner is looking at things as an independent voice of scrutiny. I think it's important that the role and powers of the commissioner are strengthened.

[653] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Well, we'll move, or not, these amendments when we come to them. William Powell.

[654] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I'd like to restate my support for this suite of amendments that I've co-sponsored. I think it's a very important rebalancing within the overall role of the PSBs to have a stronger commissioner role, particularly given the shift in other areas towards Welsh Ministers. This is targeted as much in terms of any future administration—I reiterate that—as to any concerns that we might have just now. I think that's really important, and that rebalancing is consistent with some of the comments that I made earlier in terms of some of the amendments that we've been promoting. So, I hope that we'll enjoy support within the committee for those. Thank you, Chair.

[655] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. A oes unrhyw Aelod arall eisiau siarad? Does any other Member wish to speak?
Jenny Rathbone. Jenny Rathbone.

[656] **Jenny Rathbone:** I think amendment 146 is most extraordinary, because I don't think we've ever discussed the idea that the future generations commissioner should have executive powers, and the power to direct public boards to merge seems to me completely outwith anything we've ever discussed before in the role of the future generations commissioner. So, I will certainly be opposing that.

[657] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Dyna ni. Diolch yn fawr. A oes unrhyw un arall eisiau siarad? Na. Y Gweinidog, felly, i ymateb i'r ddadl. **Alun Ffred Jones:** There we go. Thank you very much. Are there any other Members who wish to speak? No. I call on the Minister, therefore, to reply to the debate.

[658] **Carl Sargeant:** Again, I refer to my initial opening remarks, Chair. I acknowledge Antoinette Sandbach's concern around amendments 152, 153, 154 and 155, but Welsh Ministers have an obligation to set indicators under section 11 and section 49 as it is drafted, and is consistent with that. We therefore don't believe that these are appropriate and, therefore, we will still not be seeking to support her at this point in time. I agree with Jenny Rathbone; it is a rather odd situation for a non-elected member—a commissioner—to have executive powers to merge an organisation that is fundamentally a public body.

[659] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Felly, y cwestiwn yw: a ydych chi'n dymuno symud i bleidlais ar welliant 75, Weinidog? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Therefore, the question is: Minister, do you wish to proceed to a vote on amendment 75?

[660] **Carl Sargeant:** I do.

[661] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: A ddylid derbyn gwelliant 75. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 75 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [Objection.] The question is

i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 75? Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Mae 75 wedi pasio.

that amendment 75 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Amendment 75 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 75: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 75: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 75.
Amendment 75 agreed.*

[662] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 146? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 146?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 146 (Antoinette Sandbach, gyda chefnogaeth William Powell).
Amendment 146 (Antoinette Sandbach, supported by William Powell) moved.*

[663] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[664] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 146? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 146? Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Nid yw gwelliant 146 wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 146 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 146 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Amendment 146 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 146: O blaid 4, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 146: For 4, Abstain 1, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 146.
Amendment 146 not agreed.*

[665] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 147? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 147?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 147 (Antoinette Sandbach, gyda chefnogaeth William Powell).
Amendment 147 (Antoinette Sandbach, supported by William Powell) moved.*

[666] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[667] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 147? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 147? Pawb o blaid i ddangos. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Nid yw gwelliant 147 wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 147 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 147 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Amendment 147 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 147: O blaid 4, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 147: For 4, Abstain 1, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 147.
Amendment 147 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 76 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 76 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[668] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 76 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 76? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 76? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Diolch yn fawr. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Mae gwelliant 76 wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 76 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 76 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 76 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Thank you. Those against. Those abstaining. Amendment 76 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 76: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 76: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 76.

Amendment 76 agreed.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 77 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 77 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[669] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 77 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 77? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 77? Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos hynny. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Mae gwelliant 77 wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 77 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 77 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 77 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Amendment 77 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 77: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 77: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 77.
Amendment 77 agreed.*

[670] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a dych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 148? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 148?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 148 (Antoinette Sandbach, gyda chefnogaeth William Powell).
Amendment 148 (Antoinette Sandbach, supported by William Powell) moved.*

[671] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[672] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 148? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 148? Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 148 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 148 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. There's a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore amendment 148 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 148: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 148: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 148.

Amendment 148 not agreed.

[673] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 149?

Alun Ffred Jones: Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 149?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 149 (Antoinette Sandbach).

Amendment 149 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.

[674] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[675] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 149? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 149? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 149.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 149 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 149 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore amendment 149 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 149: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 149: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 149.

Amendment 149 not agreed.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 78 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 78 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[676] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 78 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: Amendment 78 in the name of the Minister.

[677] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 78? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y

The question is that amendment 78 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that

cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 78? amendment 78 be agreed to. Those in favour
Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos hynny. Pawb please raise your hands. Those against. Those
sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sydd yn ymatal. Felly, abstaining. Therefore, amendment 78 is
derbyniwyd gwelliant 78. agreed.

Gwelliant 78: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 78: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 78.

Amendment 78 agreed.

[678] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 150? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 150?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 150 (Antoinette Sandbach).

Amendment 150 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.

[679] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[680] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 150? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 150? O blaid—a wnewch chi ddangos? Yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 150 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 150 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20.

Gwelliant 150: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 150: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 150.

Amendment 150 not agreed.

[681] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 151? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 151?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 151 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 151 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[682] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Ydw.

Antoinette Sandbach: Yes.

[683] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 151? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 151? Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 151.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 151 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 151 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Amendment 151 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 151: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 151: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 151.
Amendment 151 not agreed.*

[684] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 152? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 152?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 152 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 152 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[685] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Yes. Move.

[686] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 152? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 152? Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 152 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 152 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Amendment 152 is not agreed.

gwelliant 152.

*Gwelliant 152: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 152: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 152.
Amendment 152 not agreed.*

[687] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 153? to move amendment 153?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 153 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 153 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[688] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[689] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 153? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 153? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Cyfartal—felly, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 153.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 153 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 153 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 153 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 153: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 153: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 153.
Amendment 153 not agreed.*

[690] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 154? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 154?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 154 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 154 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[691] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[692] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 154? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 154? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, felly, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 154. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 154 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 154 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 154 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 154: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 154: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 154.
Amendment 154 not agreed.*

[693] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 117? **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 117?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 117 (William Powell).
Amendment 117 (William Powell) moved.*

[694] **William Powell:** Move.

[695] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 117? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 117? Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos hynny, os gwelwch yn dda. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Cyfartal—felly, rwy'n defnyddio fy **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 117 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 117 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment

mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol in accordance with Standing Order 6.20.
â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd Amendment 117 is not agreed.
gwelliant 117.

*Gwelliant 117: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 117: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â
Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing
Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 117.
Amendment 117 not agreed.*

[696] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, do you wish
ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 155? to move amendment 155?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 155 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 155 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[697] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[698] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that
a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 155? A oes unrhyw amendment 155 be agreed to. Does any
wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a
i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn vote. The question is that amendment 155 be
gwelliant 155? Pawb sydd o blaid 155. Pawb agreed to. Those in favour of 155. Those
sydd yn erbyn. Cyfartal—felly, rwy'n against. There is a tied vote, so I use my
defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y casting vote against the amendment in
gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. accordance with Standing Order 6.20.
Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 155. Therefore, amendment 155 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 155: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 155: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â
Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing
Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 155.
Amendment 155 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 17 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 17 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[699] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 17 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 17 in the name of the Minister.

[700] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 17? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 17? Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Mae gwelliant 17 wedi ei dderbyn.

The question is that amendment 17 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 17 be agreed to. Those in favour please show. Those against. Those abstaining. Amendment 17 is agreed.

13:00

*Gwelliant 17: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 17: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 17.
Amendment 17 agreed.*

[701] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 156?

Alun Ffred Jones: Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 156?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 156 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 156 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[702] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[703] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 156? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 156? Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos drwy godi dwylo. Diolch yn fawr. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 156.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 156 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 156 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hands. Thank you very much. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Amendment 156 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 156: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 156: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 156.
Amendment 156 not agreed.*

Grŵp 16: Ystyr “Corff Cyhoeddus”: Darpariaeth Bellach (Gwelliant 157)
Group 16: Meaning of “Public Body”: Further Provision (Amendment 157)

[704] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn i grŵp 16, ystyr ‘corff cyhoeddus’; gwelliant 157. Dim ond un gwelliant sydd yn y grŵp hwn—gwelliant 157 yn enw Antoinette Sandbach. Galwaf ar Antoinette i symud gwelliant 157.

Alun Ffred Jones: We move to group 16, the meaning of a ‘public body’; amendment 157. There’s only one amendment in this group—amendment 157 in the name of Antoinette Sandbach. I call on Antoinette to move amendment 157.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 157 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 157 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[705] **Antoinette Sandbach:** This amendment inserts a superaffirmative procedure for regulations concerning the meaning of a public body, so it’s a relatively simple amendment.

[706] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes unrhyw Aelod arall yn dymuno siarad? Galwaf ar y Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: Are there any other Members who wish to speak? I call on the Minister.

[707] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I’m somewhat surprised by this amendment. It wasn’t a recommendation of this committee nor of the CLA committee, and therefore we will not be supporting it in this form today.

[708] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Galwaf ar Antoinette i ymateb i’r ddadl.

Alun Ffred Jones: I call on Antoinette to reply to the debate.

[709] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I heard what the Minister says.

[710] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A ydych chi’n dymuno symud i bleidlais ar welliant 157, Antoinette?

Alun Ffred Jones: Do you wish to move to a vote on amendment 157, Antoinette?

[711] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I do.

[712] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 157? A oes unrhyw

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 157 be agreed to. Does any

wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 157? Pawb sydd yn dangos o blaid i godi eu dwylo, os gwelwch yn dda. Yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 157.

Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 157 be agreed to. Those in favour please raise your hand, please. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 157 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 157: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 157: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 157.
Amendment 157 not agreed.*

Grŵp 17: Pŵer i Wneud Darpariaeth Ganlyniadol (Gwelliannau 158, 183, 184, 185, 186 a 22)

Group 17: Power to Make Consequential Provisions (Amendment 158, 183, 184, 185, 186 and 22)

[713] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym yn symud i grŵp 17: pŵer i wneud darpariaeth ganlyniadol, et cetera. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 158 yn enw Antoinette Sandbach. Galwaf ar Antoinette i gynnig gwelliant 158, i siarad am y gwelliant ac am y gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp.

Alun Ffred Jones: We move to group 17: powers to make consequential provisions, et cetera. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 158 in the name of Antoinette Sandbach. I call on Antoinette to move amendment 158, to speak to the amendment and the other amendments in the group.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 158 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 158 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[714] **Antoinette Sandbach:** This amendment removes section 52, which is incredibly widely drafted. It gives the Welsh Government Ministers power to pretty well repeal any provision that they wish. There is, of course, the ability, if they wish to change UK legislation, to do so through primary legislation. Section 52, in effect, means that they don't have to come to the Assembly to do it, and I think that that is wrong, particularly in relation to this piece of legislation. That's why this amendment has been tabled.

[715] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn, diolch. Weinidog. [*Torri ar draws.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf; arnaf i mae'r bai. Llyr Gruffydd.

Alun Ffred Jones: Okay, thank you. Minister. [*Interruption.*] I'm sorry; it's my fault. Llyr Gruffydd.

[716] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Committee, of course, received very strong representations from children's groups and carers groups expressing concerns around repeals of certain provisions in other Acts listed in Schedule 4 to the Bill. My amendment 183, in response to that, looks to delete the paragraph that repeals section 26 of the Children Act 2004. Amendment 184 is a consequential amendment to that.

[717] Amendment 185 deletes the paragraph that repeals section 40 of the National Health Service (Wales) Act 2006, and amendment 186 deletes the paragraph that repeals subsections (3) and (4) of section 14 of the Social Services and Well-being (Wales) Act 2014. So, I've tabled those in response to the concerns that have been expressed to the committee.

[718] I understand that the Minister has been discussing with some of those organisations, and, clearly, if the Minister can maybe give an undertaking to the committee that their concerns will be addressed with amendments at Stage 3, that, obviously, would change things somewhat in my mind. Under those circumstances, I'd be willing to withdraw my amendments in this group.

[719] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes Aelodau **Alun Ffred Jones:** Are there other Members eraill sy'n dymuno siarad? Jenny. who wish to speak? Jenny.

[720] **Jenny Rathbone:** This is a standard clause that enables Ministers to act in the case of unforeseen circumstances. We all know it takes time to get legislation through, and sometimes it is necessary to act immediately. It doesn't prevent legislatures from disagreeing with that, and then censuring a Minister if they've overstepped the mark, but not to have this provision for unforeseen circumstances seems to me absolutely outwith normal common practice.

[721] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. A oes **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay. Does anyone else unrhyw un arall eisiau siarad? William wish to speak? William Powell. Powell.

[722] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I shall be supporting the amendment proposed by Antoinette Sandbach because it seems to me that it does provide important protection in the event of, in the words of Jenny Rathbone, a Minister overstepping the mark, and I think that that's important.

[723] In terms of the comments made by Llyr Gruffydd in support of his suite of amendments, I very much share his concerns regarding the repeal of the carers Measure and some of the other matters that were brought to our attention, and will be minded to support those amendments. I'm also very interested to have an update from the Minister as to any progress in terms of moving that issue forward, maybe at the next stage. So, thank you very much.

[724] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw un arall? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Anyone else? Minister. Weinidog.

[725] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I listened carefully to the contribution made by Members. I find the contribution made by Antoinette Sandbach interesting—in fact, wrong. Her description of the proposals in this Bill are simply incorrect. The power in section 52 is very limited. It can only be used to make consequential, incidental, supplementary, transitional or saving provisions for the purposes of, or in connection with, giving full effect to this Bill—not the wide-ranging powers that the Member may suggest or indicated in her contribution.

[726] With regard to the issues that both Llyr and William raised, we are continuing

discussions—I believe, very positive discussions—with the carers groups. My team are tasked with finding a resolution. As was and is with the auditor general, we are continuing to do that. At Stage 3, subject to those further discussions, it will be my intention to introduce an amendment, if we need to, as appropriate to the discussions that we have with them. With regard to the children aspect of this, we have nominated them as a designated person in the lists of this Bill, but we will continue to work with these groups to ensure that they are fully recognised within the context of this Bill and legislation that may be repealed in accordance with discussions with them.

[727] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I call Antoinette to reply to the debate.
Gofynnaf i Antoinette ymateb i'r ddadl.

[728] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Well, of course, the Minister has his legal advice and we have ours. I am quite clear on the advice that I've been given, which is why this amendment has been tabled. As William Powell has said, it's there in case a Minister oversteps the mark. I think that's why that should be removed. In terms of the amendments that are being proposed by Llyr Huws Gruffydd, again, we would support those and echo the concerns that both he and William Powell have made. I think it is important that we're clear on this, particularly when you're talking about repealing specific legislation. Some of that legislation was only passed by this Assembly just last year, in the case of the social services and wellbeing Bill. I think it's regrettable, where we have legislation coming forward just a few months later, that we've already started to repeal provisions of earlier Bills.

[729] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Antoinette, a hoffech chi symud i bleidlais ar welliant 158? **Antoinette:** do you wish to proceed to a vote on amendment 158?

[730] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I do.

[731] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 158. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly, ar welliant 158. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 158. Pawb sydd o blaid i godi dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Felly, nid yw gwelliant 158 wedi'i dderbyn. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 158 be agreed. Any objections? [*Objection.*] We will move to a vote, therefore, on amendment 158. The question is that amendment 158 be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. All those against. All those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 158 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 158: O blaid 3, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 158: For 3, Abstain 2, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 158.

Amendment 158 not agreed.

[732] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym ni'n symud ymlaen, felly, at grŵp 18.

Grŵp 18: Dehongli (Gwelliannau 79, 80, 81 ac 82)
Group 18: Interpretation (Amendments 79, 80, 81 and 82)

[733] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae hwn yn ymwneud â dehongliad. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 79 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: This relates to interpretation. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 79 in the name of the Minister.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 79 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 79 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[734] Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 79, a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad am ei welliant ac am y gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp. Weinidog.

I move amendment 79, and I call on the Minister to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in the group.

[735] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I will be seeking to move all but one of the amendments in this group, and seeking to withdraw amendment 82 as a consequence of previous voting patterns by the opposition parties today. My amendments amend the interpretation section of the Bill, and are therefore to reflect the amendments, as have been discussed, in the re-drafting of this Bill as a whole. I would seek your approval to move them.

[736] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes unrhyw Aelodau eraill sy'n dymuno siarad? Na. Yn amlwg, nid oes gan y Gweinidog ddim byd ychwanegol i'w ddweud. A ydych chi'n dymuno i ni symud i bleidlais ar welliant 79, felly?

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you very much. Are there any other Members who wish to speak? No. Obviously, the Minister doesn't have anything else to add. Do you wish to move to a vote on amendment 79, in that case?

[737] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, please.

[738] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 79. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, mae gwelliant 79 wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 79 be agreed. Is there any objection? If there isn't, amendment 79 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 79 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34(i).
Amendment 79 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 80 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 80 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[739] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 80 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 80. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, mae gwelliant 80 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 80 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 80 be agreed to. Does any Member object? If there's not, amendment 80 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 80 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34(i).
Amendment 80 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 81 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 81 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[740] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 81 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 81. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, mae gwelliant 81 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 81 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 81 be agreed to. Does any Member object? If there's not, amendment 81 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 81 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34(i).
Amendment 81 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

[741] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae'r Gweinidog yn dymuno tynnu gwelliant 82 yn ôl.

Alun Ffred Jones: The Minister wishes to withdraw amendment 82.

Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 82 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 82 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.

Grŵp 19: Cychwyn (Gwelliannau 18 a 159) **Group 19: Commencement (Amendments 18 and 159)**

[742] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn ymlaen, felly, i grŵp 19, gwelliannau 18 a 159, sy'n ymwneud â chychwyn. Y prif welliant yw gwelliant 18 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: We move on, therefore, to group 19, amendments 18 and 159, which relate to commencement. The lead amendment in this group is amendment 18 in the name of the Minister.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 18 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 18 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[743] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 18 a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad am ei welliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 18 and call on the Minister to speak to his amendment.

[744] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. Again, I'm seeking the movement of this amendment, my single amendment in this group, but in the voting session, I will not be moving some other amendments as we move through the marshalled list, just to give prior warning.

[745] I am urging committee to reject amendment 159 in the name of Antoinette Sandbach, because the Bill already contains powers under section 53(3) to bring the provisions of the Act into force on the day appointed by Welsh Ministers, and, under section 55(4), to appoint different days for different cases or purposes and to include transitional provision. The amendment also restricts the factors relevant to the decision on when to commence the provisions of Part 4 to the timing of local government reform. I urge Members not to support that, and formally move amendment 18 in my name.

[746] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar Antoinette i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you very much. I call on Antoinette to speak.

[747] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Well, this amendment has been tabled largely because of the huge loss of credibility public service boards are going to have if they're set up before local government reorganisation is completed or agreed on. It seems to me that there's going to be a massive waste of public funds and public money, that potentially a brand new public service board that is seeking to apply new legislation will come into effect and, possibly within a few months, then be merged, changed, or moved, and it's going to be hugely disruptive. The five-

year time limit there is really for guidance only, but it seems to me that, without the Minister looking over all the Welsh Government's legislative programme, you're going to shoot this particular fox before it's got out of the hole, as it were, and you will damage immediately the credibility of the public service boards if you do not establish them after local government reorganisation, particularly when we're looking at the kind of reorganisation in the White Paper that has been published recently. I think it's regrettable that that overview with other legislation has not been seen in respect of the commencement of this Bill. That's why this amendment has been tabled in the form that it has, but, of course, if the Minister wants his public service boards to lack credibility, then no doubt he will oppose this amendment and we will have a hugely disruptive process being carried out across Wales—at vast expense, I might add.

[748] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Does any other Member Aelod arall yn dymuno siarad? wish to speak?

[749] **Jenny Rathbone:** I think this is a completely ridiculous amendment, because you can't suspend all activity to encourage public bodies to collaborate together until such time as we have a final map of future local government. I think people have got to start collaborating together as of today, and public service boards are an evolution of local service boards, and I simply don't understand the Member's argument on this case.

13:15

[750] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Galwaf ar y **Alun Ffred Jones:** I call on the Minister, but Gweinidog, ond a gaf i ofyn iddo a yw'n may I ask him whether it is the Minister's fwriad gan y Gweinidog i roi'r ddeddf yma intention to put this law in place and yn ei lle a'i gweithredu ar ôl aildrefnu implement it after the reorganisation of local llywodraeth leol? Ai dyna sut mae o'n government? Is that how he foresees this rhagweld y peth yn digwydd? Hynny ydy, happening? That is, I think that this point of rwy'n meddwl bod y pwynt yma o creating this law with local boards that could ddechrau'r ddeddf yma gyda byrddau lleol a then be changed fairly soon is a point allai wedyn gael eu newid yn weddol fuan yn that's—. Just in case the Minister has an bwyt digon—. Rhag ofn bod gan y opinion on this matter, I think it would be Gweinidog farn ar y mater yna, rwy'n worth responding to it. Thank you, Minister. meddwl ei fod o'n werth ymateb iddo fo. Diolch yn fawr, Weinidog.

[751] **Carl Sargeant:** I do, Chair; I have a very strong opinion on this, and I think, actually, it is my intention to introduce the sustainable development principles across the public sector as soon as possible, not in the way the Member wishes to seek for a delay in that to happen. I think it's important that we start, as soon as possible, introducing these principles of delivery at all levels of public bodies, including the public service boards in their development of the wellbeing plan. Therefore, I have no intention of waiting for any reorganisation in the aspect of change. That's why this amendment is not being supported by Government, and I would urge members of this committee to reject it, too.

[752] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. A ydych **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right. Minister, do you chi'n dymuno imi symud i bleidlais ar wish me to proceed to a vote on amendment welliant 18? 18?

[753] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, please.

[754] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that dylid derbyn gwelliant 18. Unrhyw amendment 18 be agreed to. Any objections? wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The

bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 18. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Mae gwelliant 18 wedi'i dderbyn, felly.

question is that amendment 18 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 18 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 18: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 18: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 18.
Amendment 18 agreed.*

[755] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 159?

Alun Ffred Jones: Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 159?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 159 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 159 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.*

[756] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I do. Move.

[757] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 159. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 159. Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sydd yn ymatal. Felly, nid yw gwelliant 159 wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 159 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 159 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Therefore, amendment 159 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 159: O blaid 2, Ymatal 3, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 159: For 2, Abstain 3, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 159.
Amendment 159 not agreed.*

[758] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to

chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 118?

move amendment 118?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 118 (William Powell).
Amendment 5 (William Powell) moved.*

[759] **William Powell:** Yes, please, Chair.

[760] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynir gwelliant 118, bydd gwelliannau 53, 54, a 55 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 118. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 118. Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos hynny. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pleidlais gyfartal, felly rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 118.

Alun Ffred Jones: If amendment 118 is agreed, amendments 53, 54 and 55 will fall. The question is that amendment 118 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. The question is that amendment 118 be agreed to. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I'll use my casting vote against the amendment in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 118 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 118: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 118: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 118.
Amendment 118 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 53 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 53 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[761] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit, cynigiau welliant 53 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 53. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gan nad oes, fe dderbyniwyd gwelliant 53.

Alun Ffred Jones: Right, I move amendment 53 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 53 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No? Therefore amendment 53 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 53 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 53 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 54 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 54 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[762] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 54 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A ddylid derbyn

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 54 in the name of the Minister. Should amendment

gwelliant 54? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, mae gwelliant 54 wedi'i dderbyn. 54 be agreed to? Does any Member object? If not, amendment 54 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 54 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 54 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 55 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 55 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[763] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 55 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 55. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, derbyniwyd gwelliant 55. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 55 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 55 be agreed to. Does any Member object? If not, amendment 55 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 55 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 55 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 56 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 56 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[764] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 56 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 56. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, derbyniwyd gwelliant 56. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 56 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 56 be agreed to. Any objections? If not, amendment 56 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 56 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 56 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 57 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 57 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[765] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 57 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 57. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, derbyniwyd gwelliant 57. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 57 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 57 be agreed to. Any objections? If not, amendment 57 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 57 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 57 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 58 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 58 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[766] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 58 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 58. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, derbyniwyd gwelliant 58. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 58 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 58 be agreed to. Any objections? If not, amendment 58 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 58 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 58 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 59 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 59 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[767] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 59 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 59. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, derbyniwyd gwelliant 59.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 59 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 59 be agreed to. Any objections? If not, amendment 59 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 59 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 59 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 60 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 60 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[768] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 60 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 60. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, derbyniwyd gwelliant 60.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 60 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 60 be agreed to. Any objections? If not, amendment 60 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 60 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 60 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 19 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 19 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[769] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 19 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 19. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, derbyniwyd gwelliant 19.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 19 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 19 be agreed to. Any objections? If not, amendment 19 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 19 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 19 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 20 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 20 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[770] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 20 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 20. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, derbyniwyd gwelliant 20.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 20 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 20 be agreed to. Are there any objections? If not, amendment 20 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 20 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 20 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 83 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 83 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[771] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 83 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 83. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, derbyniwyd gwelliant 83.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 83 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 83 be agreed to. Any objections? If not, amendment 83 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 83 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 83 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 21 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 21 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[772] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 21 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 21 in the name of the Minister.

[773] Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 21. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, derbyniwyd gwelliant 21. The question is that amendment 21 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No, therefore, amendment 21 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 21 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 21 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[774] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 183? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 183?

[775] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Wel, na; mewn ymateb i sylwadau'r Gweinidog yn gynharach ynglŷn â'r ymdrech i drïo cwrdd â rhai o ofidiau mudiadau pobl ifainc a mudiadau gofalwyr o fewn Cyfnod 3, nid wyf yn dymuno cynnig 183, 184, 185 na 186. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Well, no; in response to the Minister's comments earlier about the effort to try and meet some of the concerns of young persons' bodies and carers' bodies at Stage 3, I don't want to move 183, 184, 185 or 186.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliannau 183, 184, 185 a 186 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendments 183, 184, 185 and 186 (Llyr Gruffydd) not moved.*

[776] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, mae'r gwelliannau hynny wedi'u tynnu yn ôl. Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, those amendments have been withdrawn. Thank you very much.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 22 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 22 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[777] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn felly at welliant 22 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 22? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nid oes; derbyniwyd gwelliant 22, felly. **Alun Ffred Jones:** We turn, therefore, to amendment 22 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 22 be agreed. Is there any objection? No; therefore, amendment 22 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 22 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 22 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[778] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cyn gwaredu gwelliant 62, byddwn yn ymdrin â'r gwelliant i'r gwelliant hwnnw. Llyr, a ydych yn dymuno— **Alun Ffred Jones:** Before disposing of amendment 62, we will deal with the amendment to that amendment. Llyr, do you wish—

[779] **Carl Sargeant:** Chair, if I may, for clarification, I will not be seeking to move amendment 62; therefore, would amendment 62A still be appropriate?

[780] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes unrhyw un **Alun Ffred Jones:** Does anybody else wish

arall am symud y gwelliant? Wyt ti eisiau symud y gwelliant? to move the amendment? Do you wish to move the amendment?

[781] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Na.

Llyr Gruffydd: No.

[782] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit, felly mae 62A wedi ei dynnu yn ôl.

Alun Ffred Jones: All right, therefore, 62A is withdrawn.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 62A (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 62A (Llyr Gruffydd) not moved.*

[783] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ac mae'r Gweinidog yn tynnu gwelliant 62 yn ôl.

Alun Ffred Jones: And the Minister is withdrawing amendment 62.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 62 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 62 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[784] **Carl Sargeant:** Chair, if it's helpful, I will not be moving 62, 63, 65, 67, 68 or 69.

[785] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Well, as we come to them—

[786] **Carl Sargeant:** Okay, Chair.

[787] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, nid ydych yn cynnig gwelliant 63.

Alun Ffred Jones: So, you are not moving amendment 63.

[788] You're not moving 63.

[789] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 63 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 63 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[790] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 64 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 64 in the name of the Minister.

[791] **Carl Sargeant:** No, not that one, either.

[792] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Sixty-six.

[793] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

[794] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Nor 65.

[795] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 65 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 65 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[796] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Nor 67.

[797] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 67 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 67 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.

[798] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Sixty-eight.

[799] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 68 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 68 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[800] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Sixty-nine.

[801] **Carl Sargeant:** Not 69.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 69 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 69 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[802] **Carl Sargeant:** Chair, unfortunately, my notes are scattered at this point. [*Laughter.*] May I, with your indulgence, just refer back to amendment 64, which you did ask and I said we wouldn't be moving? I would be seeking to move that, if that was appropriate still.

[803] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ie, debyg iawn. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Yes, that's fine.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 64 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 64 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[804] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 64 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 64? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, mae gwelliant 64 wedi ei dderbyn. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 64 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 64 be agreed to. Any objections? If there are none, amendment 64 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 64 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 64 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[805] **Carl Sargeant:** And 66, and that is our final one, we believe.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 66 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 66 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[806] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 66 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn 66? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Na. Felly, mae gwelliant 66 wedi ei dderbyn. **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, I move amendment 66 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 66 be agreed. Any objections? No. Therefore, amendment 66 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 66 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 66 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[807] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 98. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 98.

[808] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes. Move.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 98 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 98 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[809] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 98 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 98? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 98.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 98 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 98 be agreed. Any objections? No. Amendment 98 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 98 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 98 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

[810] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 121?

Alun Ffred Jones: Antoinette, do you wish to move amendment 121?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 121 (Antoinette Sandbach).
Amendment 121 (Antoinette Sandbach) moved.

[811] **Antoinette Sandbach:** Move.

[812] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 121? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn at bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 121? Pawb sydd o blaid 121. Diolch. Ac yn erbyn. Felly, nid yw 121 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 121 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We will move to a vote. The question is that amendment 121 be agreed to. Everyone in favour of 121. Thank you. And against. Therefore, 121 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 121: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 121: For 3, Abstain 0, Against 7.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
 Powell, William
 Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
 Gruffydd, Llyr
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Morgan, Julie
 Price, Gwyn R.
 Rathbone, Jenny
 Watson, Joyce

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 121.
Amendment 121 not agreed.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 84 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 84 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[813] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 84 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 84? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, derbyniwyd gwelliant 84.

Alun Ffred Jones: Amendment 84 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 84 be agreed. Any objection? If there's none, amendment 84 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 84 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 84 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 70 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 70 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[814] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 70. Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 70 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 70? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nid oes. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 70.

Alun Ffred Jones: Amendment 70. I move amendment 70 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 70 be agreed. Is there any objection? There's not. Therefore, amendment 70 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 70 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.

Amendment 70 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 71 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 71 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[815] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 71 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 71? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 71.

Alun Ffred Jones: Amendment 71 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 71 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. Amendment 71 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 71 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.

Amendment 71 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 72 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 72 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[816] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 72 yn enw'r Gweinidog, rwy'n ei gynnig. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 72? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nid oes. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 72 felly.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 72 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 72 be agreed. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 72 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 72 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.

Amendment 72 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Grŵp 20: Teitl Hir (Gwelliannau 61, 61A a 61B) **Group 20: Long Title (Amendments 61, 61A and 61B)**

[817] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym yn symud rŵan i grŵp 20—y teitl hir. Mae yna welliannau yma. Mae gwelliant 61 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: We now move to group 20—the long title. There are amendments here. Amendment 61 is in the name of the Minister.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 61 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 61 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[818] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 61 ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i siarad am y gwelliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp. Diolch. Weinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 61 and call on the Minister to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in the group. Thank you. Minister.

[819] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. My amendment amends the long title of the Bill. I seek to move amendment 61 in this group. The amendment is necessary to reflect the other amendments we've discussed today. It's also directly in response to, and addresses, the committee's recommendations, as were provided in your report. As opposed to the non-Government amendments proposed by Llyr, we spoke earlier about the fact that the Bill does recognise, we believe, cultural aspects, with regard to it having its own wellbeing goal,

despite the fact that many of the other goals have been rejected by opposition parties this afternoon. I will ensure we do some more work with others to try to resolve that issue. It is, however, disappointing that we weren't able to coalesce around some of those new goal provisions today. I formally move.

[820] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar Llyr Gruffydd i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you. I call on Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[821] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch yn fawr, Gadeirydd. Eto, mae gwelliannau 61A a 61B yn pigo i fyny ar welliannau blaenorol i ychwanegu'r gair 'diwylliannol' i restr o bileri amgylcheddol, economaidd a chymdeithasol am yr un rhesymau y gwnes i amlinellu yn gynharach. Felly, ni wnaf ailadrodd, dim ond cynnig y ddau welliant.

Llyr Gruffydd: Thank you very much, Chair. Once again, amendments 61A and 61B pick up on the previous amendments to add the word 'cultural' to the list of environmental, economic and social pillars, for the same reasons that I outlined earlier. So, I won't repeat that, just move the two amendments.

[822] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes yna Aelodau sy'n dymuno siarad? Antoinette.

Alun Ffred Jones: Are there are other Members who wish to speak? Antoinette.

[823] **Antoinette Sandbach:** We would have supported all the amendments laid by Llyr Huws Gruffydd in terms of amending things to include the word 'cultural'. I think it's important. In the light of what the Minister has said, clearly, we'll leave it up to Llyr, but we would jointly table that if it wasn't present in a subsequent Bill.

[824] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Weinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you very much. Minister.

[825] **Carl Sargeant:** Nothing to add.

[826] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit. Cyn gwaredu gwelliant 61, byddwn yn ymdrin â'r gwelliannau i'r gwelliant hwnnw. Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 61A?

Alun Ffred Jones: Right. Before disposing of amendment 61, we will deal with the amendments to that amendment. Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 61A?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 61A (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 61A (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[827] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[828] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 61A? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad. [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 61A? Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos hynny. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal. Rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais yn erbyn y gwelliant, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 61A.

Alun Ffred Jones: Right. The question is that the amendment 61A be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] So, we move to a vote. The question is that amendment 61A be agreed. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote. I use my casting vote against the amendment, in accordance with Standing Order 6.20. Therefore, amendment 61A is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 61A: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 61A: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 61A.
Amendment 61A not agreed.*

[829] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 61B?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 61B?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 61B (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 61B (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[830] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[831] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw, felly: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 61B? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 61B, a allwch chi ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda? Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Felly, mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal. Rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20, yr ydym mor gyfarwydd â hi bellach. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 61B.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that the amendment 61B be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. Those in favour of amendment 61B, please raise your hands. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote against the amendment, in accordance with Standing Order 6.20, with which we are so familiar by now. So, amendment 61B is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 61B: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 61B: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 61B.
Amendment 61B not agreed.*

[832] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn i bleidlais, felly, ar 61, Weinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: We'll move to a vote on 61, Minister.

[833] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes.

[834] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ydych yn barod i dderbyn gwelliant 61, heb ei ddiwygio, wrth gwrs? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i 61? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Reit. Felly, rydym yn symud i bleidlais ar 61. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 61? Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 61, os gwelwch yn dda. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Pawb sy'n ymatal. Mae gwelliant 61 wedi'i basio.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 61 be agreed to, without amendment, of course. Is there any objection to 61? [*Objection.*] Right. Therefore, we move to a vote on amendment 61. The question is that amendment 61 be agreed. Those in favour of amendment 61, please raise your hands. Those against. Those abstaining. Amendment 61 is agreed.

*Gwelliant 61: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 61: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick
Morgan, Julie
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 61.
Amendment 61 agreed.*

[835] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Dyma ni wedi cyrraedd diwedd y sesiwn. A gaf i ddiolch i'r Gweinidog a'i swyddogion am eu presenoldeb? Mi fydd yna drawsgrifiad o'r cyfarfod i'w wirio am gywirdeb ffeithiol.

Alun Ffred Jones: We've reached the end of our session. May I thank the Minister and his officials for their presence? There will be a transcript of the meeting to check for factual accuracy.

[836] Mae hynny'n cwblhau trafodion Cyfnod 2. Bydd Cyfnod 3 yn dechrau yfory. Bydd y dyddiadau perthnasol ar gyfer trafodion Cyfnod 3 yn cael eu cyhoeddi maes o law.

That completes Stage 2 proceedings. Stage 3 begins tomorrow. The relevant dates for Stage 3 proceedings will be published in due course.

13:30

[837] Mae'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn gwneud darpariaeth i'r Gweinidog baratoi memorandwm esboniadol diwygiedig sy'n ystyried y gwelliannau y cytunwyd arnynt heddiw. Bydd y memorandwm diwygiedig yn cael ei osod o leiaf pum niwrnod gwaith cyn trafodion Cyfnod 3. Bydd y cyfarfod nesaf yn cael ei gynnal ar 11 Chwefror pan fydd y pwyllgor yn clywed gan y Dirprwy Weinidog Ffermio a Bwyd mewn perthynas â'r polisi amaeth cyffredinol.

Standing Orders make provision for the Minister to prepare a revised explanatory memorandum taking account of the amendments agreed today. The revised memorandum will be laid at last five working days before Stage 3 proceedings. The next meeting will be held on 11 February when the committee will hear from the Deputy Minister for Farming and Food in relation to the common agriculture policy.

[838] Os caf i jest ddweud un peth, a gaf i ddiolch i bawb sydd wedi cymryd rhan?

May I just say one thing, and thank everyone who's taken part? I know it's very difficult in

Rwy'n gwybod ei bod yn anodd yn y terms of these types of sessions.
sesiynau yma.

[839] My only plea would be for people to talk with each other—all of us—so that we can resolve some of the issues that have arisen this morning. I would urge, not just the Minister, but all of us to do that, in order that we can have the best possible Bill eventually. Okay. Diolch yn fawr iawn. Thank you.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 13:30.
The meeting ended at 13:30.